

Written materials relating to an item on this agenda that are distributed to the legislative bodies within 72 hours before the item is to be considered at its regularly scheduled meeting will be made available for public inspection on the City of Oxnard website. Commission agendas are available on the City of Oxnard website 7 days prior to regular meetings, at [www.oxnard.org/city-meetings](http://www.oxnard.org/city-meetings)

AGENDA  
MOBILE HOME PARK RENT  
REVIEW BOARD  
Regular Meeting  
City Council Chambers, 305 West  
Third Street, Oxnard, CA 93030  
January 27, 2025  
6:00 P.M.



**To join remotely, click on the link below:**

<https://us06web.zoom.us/j/82829799235?pwd=UvpiRlmHcRkiopWuydtPiQ3XVfg0V.1>

**Or telephone (toll-free): 877 853 5257**

Meeting ID: 828 2979 9235

Passcode: 006749

If you wish to speak during public comments or a particular item on the agenda, please sign-on by following the zoom call in steps listed above. Once the Chair calls for public speakers, press \*9 to raise your hand, or if online, click the raise hand icon in the Zoom interface to inform the Chair you would like to speak during the public speaking section for that particular item on the agenda.

**YOU MAY PARTICIPATE IN THE MEETING IN THE FOLLOWING WAYS:**

1. ATTEND THE MEETING AT THE LOCATION LISTED ABOVE OR VIA ZOOM
2. EMAIL COMMENTS OR REQUESTS TO SPEAK BEFORE THE MEETING
  - a. Submit a request to speak no later than 1 P.M. on the day of the meeting by contacting the Commission Secretary Christian Lopez at [christian.lopez@oxnard.org](mailto:christian.lopez@oxnard.org). Please indicate the agenda item number in the subject line.
3. PROVIDING PUBLIC COMMENTS REMOTELY DURING THE MEETING
  - a. To provide a public comment during the meeting dial 877 853 5257 and enter the Meeting ID and Passcode listed above as the Zoom details for this meeting. When the Chair announces the particular item on the agenda you want to speak on, press \*9 to raise your hand. Once called on, press \*6 to unmute your phone.
  - b. Public comments on agenda items will be taken following the announcement of the item. After the item is announced, members of the public shall have three minutes to register or otherwise be recognized for the purpose of providing public comment.

A. ROLL CALL/PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

B. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

1. SUBJECT: Minutes of the meeting of April 25, 2024.  
RECOMMENDATION: Approve.

C. PUBLIC COMMENTS

At a regular meeting, a person may address the Mobile Home Park Rent Review Board only on matters within the subject matter jurisdiction of the Commission. The presiding officer shall limit public comments to three minutes. The Board cannot enter into detailed discussion or take action on

any item presented during public comments not on the agenda. Such items may only be referred to the Commission Secretary for administrative action or scheduled on a subsequent agenda for discussion. Unless otherwise approved by the Commission, persons wishing to speak on items not on the agenda should do so during public comments.

D. REPORTS

1. SUBJECT: Mobile Home Park Rent Stabilization System Annual Activity Report for Calendar Year 2024  
RECOMMENDATION: That the Board review and adopt the Calendar Year 2024 Annual Activity Report to City Council, and authorize the Chair to submit the report to City Council.

E. COMMISSION BUSINESS

1. SUBJECT: Election of Chair and Vice-Chair  
RECOMMENDATION: That the Board elect a Chair and Vice-Chair to serve for 2025.

F. COMMISSIONER COMMENTS

G. ITEMS FOR FUTURE CONSIDERATION

H. ADJOURNMENT

In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you require special assistance to participate in a meeting, please contact Christian Lopez at (805) 200-5941. Notification at least 72 hours prior to the meeting will enable the City to reasonably arrange for your accessibility to the meeting.

MINUTES  
MOBILE HOME RENT REVIEW BOARD  
April 25, 2024

A. ROLL CALL/PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

At 5:30 P.M., the special meeting of the Mobile Home Park Rent Review Board convened in the Oxnard City Council Chambers. Commissioners Cynthia Daniels, Felipe Flores, Efrain Jimenez, Yukio Okano and Martin L. Remmen were present. Staff members present were Emilio Ramirez, Housing Director; Albert Ramirez, Assistant Housing Director; Ken Rozell, Chief Assistant City Attorney; Jason Zaragoza, Deputy City Attorney; Andrew Gonzalez, Deputy City Attorney; and Christian Lopez, Recording Secretary. Chair Jimenez presided and called the meeting to order.

B. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

1. SUBJECT: Minutes of the meeting of April 10, 2024.  
RECOMMENDATION: Approve.  
ACTION: Vice- Chair Daniels moved approval as recommended. Commissioner Okano seconded and the motion carried unanimously.

C. PUBLIC COMMENTS

No public comments made at the meeting.

D. COMMISSION BUSINESS

1. SUBJECT: Stipulation, Order and Settlement Agreement for Kona Kai Estates  
RECOMMENDATION: That the Mobile Home Park Rent Review Board approve the Stipulation and Order for Kona Kai Estates and confirm the Mobile Home Park Rent Review Board's acceptance of the Settlement Agreement and Mutual Release.  
DISCUSSION: Anthony C. Rodriguez, Esq. provided comments during the presentation as the park's representative. Barbara Macri-Ortiz, Esq. provided comments during the presentation as the homeowner's representative. Commissioners Felipe Flores, Yukio Okano, Martin L. Remmen, Vice-Chair Cynthia Daniels, and Chair Efrain Jimenez provided comments during the presentation.  
ACTION: Chair Jimenez made the motion to approve the recommended action, Vice-Chair Daniels seconded and the motion carried unanimously.

E. REPORT OF THE COMMISSION SECRETARY

No report of the commission secretary.

F. COMMISSIONER COMMENTS

No commissioner comments.

G. ITEMS FOR FUTURE CONSIDERATION

No items for future consideration.

H. ADJOURNMENT

At 6:01 P.M. Commissioner Okano moved the meeting adjourn. Vice-Chair Daniels seconded, and the motion carried unanimously.

---

Christian Lopez, Secretary

---

Efrain Jimenez, Chairman



**TO:** Honorable Members of the Mobile Home Park Rent Review Board

**FROM:** Albert Ramirez, Assistant Housing Director, (805) 385-8016,  
albert.ramirez@oxnard.org

**DATE:** January 27, 2025

**SUBJECT: Mobile Home Park Rent Stabilization System Annual Activity Report for  
Calendar Year 2024**

## **RECOMMENDATION**

That the Board review and adopt the Calendar Year 2024 Annual Activity Report to City Council, and authorize the Chair to submit the report to City Council.

## **DISCUSSION**

The Mobile Home Park Rent Review Board is a quasi-judicial body established pursuant to Chapter 24-5 of the Oxnard City Code. Section 24-6 of the Oxnard City Code states in its entirety as follows:

### ***SEC. 24.6 POWERS AND DUTIES OF THE BOARD***

Within the limitations provided by state law, the Board shall have the following powers and duties:

*(A) Reasons for Meetings – To meet from time-to-time to discharge the Board’s duties as set forth in this Chapter.*

*(B) Powers – To collect evidence and information to implement this chapter, initiate investigations, schedule and conduct hearing or appeals, and issue written findings and decisions regarding the implementation of this Chapter.*

*(C) Annual Report – To prepare, at least annually, a comprehensive written report to the City Council concerning Board activities, decisions, findings, and actions, and all other matters governed by this Chapter.*

*(D) Administrative Rules - Within the limitations provided by law or by rules adopted by the City Council, and after a public hearing, with due notice to owners and residents and/or their representatives, associations and council, to adopt, amend and rescind administrative rules to effectuate the purposes and policies of this Chapter.*

The current Board consists of three Commissioners who were appointed to three-year terms: Felipe Flores, appointed by City Council on January 23, 2018; Commissioner Efrain Jimenez, appointed by City Council on May 21, 2019; and Commissioner Yukio Okano, appointed by City Council on February 20, 2024. Commissioner Martin Lee Remmen resigned effective November 1, 2024; and Commissioner Cynthia Daniels resigned effective November 30, 2024.

In accordance with Sec. 24-6 (C) above, staff has prepared the attached Annual Activity Report for 2024. Staff presents this report to the Board for your review, input and discussion. Upon finalization, staff requests that the Board approve the report and authorize the Chair to transmit the report to the City Council.

**Attachments:**

1. Annual Activity Report for Calendar Year 2024

# **ANNUAL ACTIVITY REPORT FOR 2024**

## **CITY OF OXNARD MOBILE HOME PARK RENT REVIEW BOARD**

### **1. THE BOARD**

The Mobile Home Park Rent Review Board consists of three Commissioners who were appointed to three-year terms: Felipe Flores, appointed by City Council on January 23, 2018; Commissioner Efrain Jimenez, appointed by City Council on May 21, 2019; and Commissioner Yukio Okano, appointed by City Council on February 20, 2024.

Commissioner Martin Lee Remmen resigned effective November 1, 2024; and Commissioner Cynthia Daniels resigned effective November 30, 2024.

### **2. BOARD MEETINGS**

The Rent Review Board met on April 10, 2024 and April 25, 2024

### **3. PROCESSING OF RENT INCREASE APPLICATIONS IN 2024**

#### **A. Types of Space Rent Increases**

Chapter 24 of the City Code establishes two mechanisms by which owners of mobile home parks in the City may apply for general space rent increases. Chapter 24-9 of the Code defines the procedure for C.P.I. (Consumer Price Index) Formula Adjustment increase applications, and Chapter 24-10 creates the mechanism for applying for Discretionary Rent Increases.

#### **B. Calculation of C.P.I. Space Rent Increases**

The formula by which the maximum permissible C.P.I. space rent increase for which a park may apply is set forth in Chapter 24-9(A)(1), and is based on the change in the C.P.I. from August of one year to August of the next year. Whenever that change is 4 percent or less, the maximum permissible space rent increase for the next calendar year is equivalent to 100% of that August-to-August percentage change. If the percentage change in the CPI is greater than 4 percent but less than or equal to 9 percent, the permissible CPI formula adjustment shall be equal to 75 percent of the change in the CPI, or a 4 percent adjustment, whichever is greater. If the percentage change in the CPI is greater than 9 percent, the permissible CPI formula adjustment shall be equal to 67 percent of the change in the CPI.

Maximum permissible increases in recent years have been as indicated below:

2023:	5.74%	2016:	1.14%
2022:	4.0%	2015:	1.81%
2021:	2.02%	2014:	0.84%
2020:	2.97%	2013:	2.32%
2019:	3.87%	2012:	2.41%
2018:	2.82%	2011:	0.83%
2017:	1.43%	2010:	No increase

There was no increase permitted in 2010, as 2009 was a deflationary year.

The calculation of the permissible C.P.I. increase in 2024 is as follows:

<i>August 2023 C.P.I.:</i>	324.050
<i>Minus August 2022 C.P.I.:</i>	– 313.608
<i>Equals Net Change in C.P.I.</i>	<u>10.442</u>
<i>Divided by August 2022 C.P.I.:</i>	<u>/313.608</u>
<i>Equals decimal change in C.P.I.:</i>	.0332 or 3.32%

Since the percentage change in the C.P.I. is 4 percent or less, the permissible C.P.I. formula adjustment shall be equal to 100 percent of the change in the C.P.I.

Therefore, the maximum permissible C.P.I. rent increase for calendar year 2024 is **3.32%**

### **C. Park Applications for C.P.I. Formula Rent Increases in 2024**

There are twenty (20) mobile home parks in Oxnard, ranging in size from 39 spaces to 265 spaces. All twenty (20) parks applied for 3.32% C.P.I. space rent increases to take effect in calendar year 2024:

Country Club Mobile Estates	Cypress Mobile Home Park
Evergreen R. V. Park	Imperial Oxnard Mobile Estates
Meadowlake Park	Oxnard Mobile Home Lodge
Ocean-Aire Mobile Estates	Oxnard Shores Mobile Home Park
Oxnard Pacific Mobile Estates	Royal Palms Mobile Estates
Pleasant Valley Mobile Home Park	Royal Duke Mobile Estates #2
Royal Duke Mobile Estates #1	Sunny Acres Park
Sunshine Manor Mobile Home Park	Silverwheel Mobile Home Park
The Colony Mobile Home Park	Valley Trailer Villa
Villa Capri Mobile Estates	Kona Kai Mobile Estates

#### **D. Homeowner Association Protests of C.P.I. Rent Increase Applications**

The Rent Stabilization System permits associations or groups of homeowners to challenge C.P.I. formula rent increase applications by filing a protest as defined in Chapter 24-2 of the City Code. When a protest is filed, the independent Hearing Officer conducts an evidentiary hearing, in accordance with Chapter 24-9(8) and 24-13 of the Code. If the Hearing Officer determines that the homeowners have presented evidence of a reduction in services by the park owner, and a monetary savings, the Hearing Officer may reduce the pending rent increase by the amount saved by the park owner due to the deletion of reduction in services provided to homeowners.

No Homeowner Association Protests of C.P.I. Rent Increase Applications were filed in 2024.

#### **E. Discretionary Rent Increase Applications**

The Rent Stabilization System provides an avenue for parks to apply for space rent increases in amounts greater than the C.P.I. Formula Adjustment method. When a park believes that it is not receiving a fair return on its investment, it may apply for a Discretionary Rent Increase. Such an application requires presentation of an audit; a review of the park's application by City staff; a review of the park's income and expenses by an independent Certified Public Accounting firm hired by the City; a report by that CPA to the Hearing Officer; a public hearing on the findings during which representatives of the affected homeowners and of the park owner present their evidence and arguments; and ultimately a written Decision with Findings of Fact, issued by the Hearing Officer. The requirements for the processing of Discretionary Rent Increase applications are set forth in Chapter 24-10 of the City Code, and City Council Resolution No. 11,468.

No Discretionary Rent Increase Applications were submitted in 2024.

#### **F. Utility Passthrough Applications**

The City Code also permits park owners to apply for approval to pass through utility costs when segregated out or separately metered to individual homesites within a mobile home park.

No Utility Passthrough Applications were submitted in 2024.

#### **G. Hearings conducted by Independent Hearing Officer**

Evidentiary hearings are required for the implementation of the rent stabilization ordinance. Rent increase, and change-of-occupancy determination hearings are adversarial in nature; passthrough hearings are investigative and non-adversarial.

All hearings are conducted by an independent professional hearing officer, selected through the City's formal procurement policies.

On May 13, 2024, the City's hearing officer, David Hart resigned.

In response to David Hart's resignation, the City issued a Request for Proposals (RFP) to solicit proposals for hearing officer services. Staff are in the process of selecting a new vendor and plan to have a hearing officer under contract in the first quarter of 2025.

#### **4. APPEALS TO THE RENT REVIEW BOARD**

Pursuant to Chapter 24 of the City Code, either party may appeal a Decision of the Hearing Officer if that party is dissatisfied with the ruling. Unlike appeals of rulings by the City's Planning Commission, however, appeals under the rent stabilization system do not go to the City Council. Any Hearing Officer decision which is appealed is presented to the full Mobile Home Park Rent Review Board, which conducts a review of the record in open session, in accordance with Section 24-15 of the City Code. The Board reviews the record, and entertains arguments from the parties, but does not receive testimony nor conduct a de nova hearing on the matter in dispute.

Between March 16, 2023 and March 20, 2023, a homeowner protest was filed by a group of homeowners in Kona Kai Mobile Estates. The protest petition challenges the legitimacy of Kona Kai's 2022 C.P.I Rent Increase Application which enacted a 4.0% rent increase imposed on April 1, 2022 and its potential impact on their 2023 C.P.I Rent Increase Application which proposes a 5.74% rent increase effective April 1, 2023. Based on the findings of the protest hearing, the Hearing Officer ruled that the park owners shall, within thirty (30) days of this Decision, refund or credit to homeowners the full amount of the 2023 rent increase increment that was collected from homeowners beginning in the month of April of 2023, for all months from April 2023 forward. The "full amount of the 2023 rent increase increment" is defined as the difference between the space rent for each that was approved effective April 1, 2021, and the amount of rent charged beginning in April of 2023; and the park owners must, within thirty (30) days of this Decision, returned space rents to levels which reflect the approved rent as of April 1, 2021, for each space. Any future applications for rent increase shall be calculated using the approved rent levels as of April 2021 as the basis for said future rent increases.

On October 3, 2023 the park owners of Kona Kai Mobile Estates filed an appeal to the decision by the Hearing Officer, David B. Hart, resulting from a homeowner protest that was filed by a group of homeowners in Kona Kai Mobile Estates challenging the legitimacy of Kona Kai's 2022 C.P.I. Rent Increase Application which enacted a 4.0% rent increase imposed on April 1, 2022 and its potential

impact on their 2023 C.P.I. Rent Increase Application which proposed a 5.74% rent increase effective April 1, 2023.

After the submission of the appeal, the owners of Kona Kai Mobile Estates and its homeowners entered into discussions trying to reach a settlement and avoid a hearing.

On April 25, 2024, a meeting of the Mobile Home Park Rent Review Board was held where the owners of Kona Kai Mobile Estates and the homeowners mutually decided to resolve any and all disputes between them regarding the rents that may be charged at the park through and including March 31, 2025. The stipulation was brought before the Board and confirm by the Board at the meeting.

**5. ADOPTION**

Pursuant to Chapter 24-6(C) of the Oxnard City Code, the 2024 Annual Activity Report of the Mobile Home Park Rent Review Board is hereby presented to the Oxnard City Council, having been adopted by a majority vote of the Commission at the Meeting of January 27, 2025.

Respectfully submitted,

---

, Chair

Date: January 27, 2025