

MINUTES
OXNARD PLANNING COMMISSION
SPECIAL MEETING
January 9, 2020

A. ROLL CALL

At 6:00 p.m., the special meeting of the Oxnard Planning Commission convened in the Council Chambers. Chair Frank, Vice Chair Chua, Commissioners Chavez, Dozier, Fuhring (arrived at 6:01 p.m), and Meyer were present. Commissioner Sanchez was absent. Staff members present were Jeffrey Lambert, Community Development Department Director, Scott Kolwitz, Planning & Environmental Services Manager; Jay Dobrowalski, Senior Planner; Ken Rozell, Chief Assistant City Attorney; Dee Lai and Michelle Travis Recording Secretaries. Chair Frank presided and called the meeting to order.

B. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE TO THE FLAG OF THE UNITED STATES

Commissioner Meyer led the pledge of allegiance.

C. PUBLIC COMMENTS - On Items Not On The Agenda

None

D. CONSENT AGENDA

1. APPROVAL OF MINUTES – December 5, 2019

MOTION: Commissioner Meyer moved and Commissioner Chavez seconded a motion to approve the minutes of December 5, 2020 as submitted.

VOTE: Chair Frank, Vice Chair Chua, Commissioners Chavez, Dozier, Fuhring and Meyer voted in favor. Commissioner Sanchez was absent. Commissioner Fuhring abstained. The motion carried 5:0:1:1:0¹.

E. CONTINUED PUBLIC HEARING

1. **Project Name: Verizon Danube** – PLANNING AND ZONING PERMIT NO. 18-530-01 (Special Use Permit) Request to construct a 47-foot tall wireless communications facility designed as a faux eucalyptus tree with an associated equipment enclosure within a 596 square-foot lease area adjacent to an existing three-story self-storage facility on a 1.02 acre lot in the C-2-PD zone. Pursuant to Oxnard City Code (OCC) Section 16-497, the request includes an increase in height from 35 feet to 47 feet and a reduction to the rear yard setback from 15 feet to 10 feet in the C-2-PD zone. The project is located adjacent to the southeastern corner of the Public Storage facility at 161 Ventura Boulevard (APN: 145-0-232-135). The project is

¹ In Favor: Against: Absent: Abstain: Recused

exempt from environmental review pursuant to Section 15303 of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Guidelines. Filed by Scott Dunaway (“Applicant”), 1114 State Street, Suite 234, Santa Barbara, California, 93101.

Project Planner: Jay Dobrowalski, Senior Planner

Recommendation:

That the Planning Commission continue item E-1 to date certain of March 5, 2020, as requested by the applicant.

MOTION: Commissioner Chavez moved and Chair Frank seconded a motion continue item E-1 to date certain of March 5, 2020, as requested by the applicant.

VOTE: Chair Frank, Vice Chair Chua, Commissioners Chavez, Dozier, Fuhring and Meyer voted in favor. Commissioner Sanchez was absent. The motion carried 6:0:1:0:0².

F. PUBLIC HEARING

1. **Project Name: Verizon Rio Lindo – PLANNING AND ZONING PERMIT NO. 18-530-02 (Special Use Permit)** Request to construct a 40-foot tall wireless communications facility designed as a faux eucalyptus tree with an associated equipment enclosure within a 540 square-foot lease area adjacent to an existing single-story warehouse building on a 1.0 acre lot in the Auto Sales and Service Area of the *Rose-Santa Clara Corridor Specific Plan* Area. Pursuant to Oxnard City Code (OCC) Section 16-497, the request includes an increase in height from 35 feet to 40 feet in the Auto Sales and Service Area. The project is located adjacent to the northeastern corner of the warehouse building at 1630 Ventura Boulevard (APN: 144-0-134-065). Filed by Scott Dunaway (“Applicant”), 1114 State Street, Suite 234, Santa Barbara, California, 93101.

Project Planner: Jay Dobrowalski, Senior Planner

Recommendation:

That the Planning Commission approve the Project, as conditioned, finding the Project to be Categorically Exempt from environmental review pursuant to the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Guidelines Section 15303 (New Construction or Conversion of Small Structures), and Approve Resolution 2019-XX for Planning and Zoning Permit No. 18-530-02 (Special Use Permit), subject to certain findings and conditions.

The Planning Commissioners did not have any ex parte communications to report for Item E-1.

Senior Planner, Jay Dobrowalski, provided a PowerPoint presentation outlining the request.

The applicant’s representative, Scott Dunaway (President at D4 Communications, LLC), provided a PowerPoint presentation.

Chair Frank opened the public comments portion of the public hearing.

² In Favor: Against: Absent: Abstain: Recused

No public verbal or written comments were received for Item E-1.

Chair Frank closed the public comments portion of the public hearing.

Discussion ensued among the Commissioners and staff.

MOTION: Vice Chair Chua moved and Commissioner Chavez seconded a motion to adopt a resolution approving the **Verizon Rio Lindo project** PZ No. 18-530-02 (Special Use Permit) with the following edits and conditions added to Resolution number 2020-01:

1. Planning Division Special Condition number 24 shall read as:
 - a. "In order to be less prominently distinguishable from the existing treescape in the vicinity, the proposed facility shall include the installation of two 24-inch box size large-canopy trees, similar in stature to eucalyptus trees, near the proposed faux eucalyptus tree. A California native large-canopy tree species is preferred. The exact species and location of the two 24-inch box size large-canopy ~~eucalyptus~~-trees shall be determined by the Planning Manager in consultation with the City's Landscape Architect. Prior to issuance of a building permit for the wireless communications facility, the Applicant shall obtain approval of a landscape and irrigation plan for the two 24-inch box size large-canopy ~~eucalyptus~~-trees."
2. The following three conditions shall be added as Condition numbers 50-52:
 - a. "The proposed wireless communications facility shall be designed with a microwave dish not to exceed 24 inches in diameter."
 - b. "The applicant shall install the faux eucalyptus design that was presented to the Planning Commission as Special Use Permit No. 14-530-02."
 - c. "Removal of the microwave antenna and the installation of underground fiber optics infrastructure to service the proposed wireless communications facility shall not require a discretionary permit or a Minor Modification Permit to modify this Special Use Permit."

VOTE: Chair Frank, Vice Chair Chua, and Commissioners Chavez, Dozier, Meyer, and Fuhring voted in favor. Commissioner Sanchez was absent. The motion carried 6:0:1:0:0³.

³ In Favor: Against: Absent: Abstain: Recused

G. STUDY SESSION/REPORTS

1. **Project Name:** Overview of Development Projects in Oxnard
Project Planner: **Jeff Lambert, Community Development Director**
Scott Kolwitz, Planning and Environmental Services Manager

Recommendation: That the Planning Commission receive and file this report.

Jeffrey Lambert, Community Development Department Director provided a PowerPoint presentation.

Discussion ensued among the Commissioners and staff.

2. **Project Name:** Planning Commission Working Session
Project Planner: **Jeff Lambert, Community Development Director**
Scott Kolwitz, Planning and Environmental Services Manager

Recommendation: That the Planning Commission receive and file this report.

Discussion ensued among the Commissioners and staff. The Planning Commission provided the following comments to staff:

1. Include a detailed explanation of any deviation requests. Identify the constraints that lead to the deviation. Include options considered to avoid a deviation. The Planning Commission thought the deviation request presented in the Verizon Rio Lindo project today was a good example.
2. For residential projects, provide information identifying how the project will help the City meet our housing production goals.
3. The Planning Commission requested they be provided a link to the City's Housing Element Annual Progress Report provided to California Department of Housing and Community Development.
4. Staff should conduct a "more critical review of plans" from a user's perspective. For example, the Planning Commission described Raising Cane's circulation issues should have been vetted before the item was presented to the Planning Commission.
5. A maximum of 3 items per meeting is preferred.
6. Ensure the Planning Division is getting input from all other Departments.
7. Can staff include any relevant "previous rulings" for similar projects to the Planning Commission?
8. Can staff include a "sustainability lens" (energy and water) in our reviews of projects?
9. Can staff break long paragraphs into shorter paragraphs to make it easier to read documents?
10. The Planning Commission is pleased with the quality of the reports lately.
11. The Planning Commission stated the Resolution quality has improved recently.
12. Powerpoint presentations are good and on point. Staff should continue to highlight the most important factors/issues to consider.

H. PLANNING COMMISSION BUSINESS

1. Nomination and Election of the Planning Commission Chair and Vice Chair to Serve for Calendar Year 2020.

Recommendation: Nominate and Select Chair and Vice Chair.

CHAIR NOMINATIONS:

Chair Frank opened the nomination for the new Chair.

1. Chair Frank nominated herself for the new Chair.
2. Commissioner Chavez nominated himself for the new Chair.

Chair Frank closed the nominations for the new Chair. The Chair then called a vote of each nominated Commissioner for Chair in the same sequence the nominations were received until a Commissioner received a simple majority vote of all members present.

VOTE: Chair Frank, Vice Chair Chua, Commissioners Dozier, Fuhring, and Meyer voted in favor for Chair Frank to be the 2020 Chair. Commissioner Chavez voted no. Commissioner Sanchez was absent. The motion carried 5:1:1:0:0⁴.

As a simple majority vote was obtained, no vote was taken for Commissioner Chavez to be the 2020 Chair.

VICE CHAIR NOMINATIONS:

Chair Frank opened the nomination for the new Vice Chair.

1. Chair Frank nominated Vice Chair Chua for the new Vice Chair.
2. Commissioner Chavez nominated Commissioner Fuhring for the new Vice Chair. This nomination was then withdrawn.
3. Commissioner Dozier nominated Commissioner Sanchez for the new Vice Chair.
4. Vice Chair Chua nominated himself for the new Vice Chair.
5. Commissioner Chavez nominated himself for the new Vice Chair.

Chair Frank closed the nominations for the new Vice Chair. The Chair then called a vote of each nominated Commissioner for Vice Chair in the same sequence the nominations were received until a Commissioner received a simple majority vote of all members present.

VOTES: Vice Chair Chua for the new Vice Chair. Chair Frank and Vice Chair Chua, voted in favor for Vice Chair Chua to be the 2020 Vice Chair. Commissioners Chavez, Dozier, Fuhring and Meyer voted no. Commissioner Sanchez was absent. The motion failed 2:4:1:0:0⁵.

Commissioner Sanchez for the new Vice Chair. Chair Frank, Vice Chair Chua, and Commissioner Dozier voted in favor for Commissioner Sanchez to be the

⁴ In Favor: Against: Absent: Abstain: Recused

⁵ In Favor: Against: Absent: Abstain: Recused

2020 Vice Chair. Commissioners Chavez, Fuhring and Meyer voted no. Commissioner Sanchez was absent. The motion failed 3:3:1:0:0⁶.

Vice Chair Chua for the new Vice Chair. Chair Frank, Vice Chair Chua, Commissioners Dozier, and Meyer voted in favor for Vice Chair Chua to be the 2020 Vice Chair. Commissioners Chavez and Fuhring voted no. Commissioner Sanchez was absent. The motion carried 4:2:1:0:0⁷.

I. COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT STAFF UPDATES

Jeffrey Lambert, Community Development Department Director stated that Commissioners Chavez and Meyer will be attending the League of California Cities Planning Commission Academy from March 4 to 6, 2020, in Sacramento.

J. ADJOURNMENT

At 7:54 p.m., the Planning Commission concurred to adjourn.

FUTURE MEETINGS

Thursday, January 16, 2020, 6:00 p.m., City Council Chambers



Deirdre Frank, Chair

ATTEST:



Scott Kolwitz, Planning & Environmental Services Manager

⁶ In Favor: Against: Absent: Abstain: Recused

⁷ In Favor: Against: Absent: Abstain: Recused