

CITY OF OXNARD PLANNING COMMISSION AGENDA

REGULAR MEETING
Council Chambers, 305 West Third Street
Thursday, April 20, 2023, 6:00 p.m.

The public may view the meeting from home on the City's website at Oxnard.org/city-meetings, Spectrum Channel 10, Frontier Channel 35, or YouTube at Youtube.com/oxnardnews. Video recordings are typically available online following the meeting at the City's website at <http://www.oxnard.org/city-meetings>

YOU MAY PARTICIPATE IN THE MEETING IN THE FOLLOWING WAYS:

1. ATTEND THE MEETING AT THE LOCATION LISTED ABOVE: Submit a speaker card.
2. EMAILING COMMENTS OR REQUESTS TO SPEAK BEFORE THE MEETING
 - a. Submit an email to Planning@oxnard.org no later than 3:00 p.m. on the day of the meeting (Please indicate the agenda item number in the subject line). All email correspondence will be forwarded to the Planning Commission prior to the start of the meeting and made part of the legislative record.
 - b. Submit a request to speak by no later than 3pm on the day of the meeting by using the form <https://forms.gle/yZoc4GkLCaPyoFc69>, emailing the Planning office at planning@oxnard.org, or calling (805) 385-7858.
3. PROVIDING PUBLIC COMMENTS DURING THE MEETING
 - a. Speakers shall have up to three minutes to speak.
 - b. If you wish to speak during public comments or a particular item on the agenda, please follow the below instructions:
 1. Dial phone number (888) 475-4499
 2. Enter the meeting ID: 814 9461 8608
 3. Enter the meeting passcode: 238071
 4. Wait in the Zoom waiting room. Once the Chair calls for public speakers, press *9 to raise your hand to inform the recording secretary you would like to speak..
 - c. Public comments on items not on the agenda shall be taken at the beginning of the meeting. If there are more speakers than can be accommodated during thirty minutes, additional speakers who will be given an opportunity to speak at the end of the meeting.
 - d. Public comments on items on the agenda shall be taken following the announcement of the item.

In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need special assistance to participate in a meeting, you should contact the office of the City Clerk at (805) 385-7803. Notification 72 hours prior to the meeting will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements to assure accessibility to the meeting.

Written materials relating to an item on this agenda that are distributed to the Planning Commission within 72 hours before the item is to be considered at its regularly scheduled meeting will be made available for public inspection at 214 South C Street, during customary business hours.

A. ROLL CALL**B. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE TO THE FLAG OF THE UNITED STATES****C. PUBLIC COMMENTS - On Items Not On The Agenda**

At this time, a person may address the Planning Commission on matters within the jurisdiction of the Planning Commission, including information/consent items and any item not appearing on the agenda. The Chair shall limit public comments to three (3) minutes. The Planning Commission cannot take action on any item presented during public comments that is not on the agenda and such item may only be referred to the Commission Secretary. Persons wishing to speak on public hearing items should do so at the time of the public hearing.

D. CONSENT AGENDA

1. APPROVAL OF MINUTES - January 19, 2023
2. APPROVAL OF MINUTES - February 2, 2023

E. EX PARTE DECLARATIONS FOR PUBLIC HEARING ITEMS**F. PUBLIC HEARING**

1. **Project Name: Catamaran Duplex;** Planning and Zoning Permit No. 22-400-04 (Coastal Development Permit) to authorize the construction of a residential duplex totaling 5,154 square-feet, located at 920 Catamaran (APN: 196-0-032-015). A request to construct a two-story 5,154 square-foot residential duplex building consisting of two, attached three-bedroom dwelling units which are each 2,577 square feet with an attached square-foot two-car garage, and will also include a 120 square-foot covered patio, a 44 square foot porch, and a 298 square-foot deck on a 6,480 square-foot vacant lot. Filed by Rick Moraga, on behalf of property owner Morris Dunes, LLC, 115 N. Lucia Avenue, Unit B, Redondo Beach, California, 90277.

City Staff: Susan Hernandez, Contract Planner

Recommendation: That the Planning Commission

- a. Find the Project to be Categorically Exempt from environmental review pursuant to the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Guidelines Section 15303 (New Construction or Conversion of Small Structures); and
- b. Adopt Resolution 2023-XX approving Planning and Zoning Permit No. 22-400-04 (Coastal Development Permit), subject to certain findings and conditions.

Please click the following link to view the required Measure M pre-recorded presentation video: <https://youtu.be/Zzs2LEmjw3o>

2. **Project Name: General Plan Conformity for Waterline Easement Vacation** - 4201 and 4211 West Hemlock Street; APN(s): 188-0-120-110, -100, -095; Planning and Zoning

In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need special assistance to participate in a meeting, you should contact the office of the City Clerk at (805) 385-7803. Notification 72 hours prior to the meeting will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements to assure accessibility to the meeting.

Written materials relating to an item on this agenda that are distributed to the Planning Commission within 72 hours before the item is to be considered at its regularly scheduled meeting will be made available for public inspection at 214 South C Street, during customary business hours.

Permit No. 23-625-01 (General Plan Conformity). A request that Planning Commission adopt a resolution affirming that partially vacating a waterline easement on the properties 4201 and 4211 West Hemlock Street is in conformance with the City of Oxnard 2030 General Plan. The site is located within the 2030 General Plan land use designation of Residential Existing (REX) and is zoned Single Family Water Oriented (R-W-1) in the City of Oxnard. Requested by applicants Marc and Chi Hermann, 707 Via Zamora, Camarillo, CA 93010.

City Staff: Daniel Houck, Associate Planner

Recommendation: That the Planning Commission:

- a. Find the project Exempt from environmental review pursuant to the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Guidelines Section 15061(b)(3) and Section 15378(b)(5); and
- b. Adopt Resolution 2023-XX affirming that the City of Oxnard's proposed partial vacation of the waterline easement at 4201 and 4211 West Hemlock Street is in conformance with the City of Oxnard 2030 General Plan/Coastal Land Use Plan, and recommending that the City Council order the vacation.

Please click the following link to view the required Measure M pre-recorded presentation video: <https://youtu.be/l1FbCfAwnHU>

3. **Project Name: 2030 General Plan and Local Coastal Plan Conformity Determination for the City of Oxnard Revised Capital Improvement Program (CIP) Fiscal Years (FY) 2022-2027.** The Planning Commission will review the Revised CIP for FY 2022-2027 to confirm they are in conformance with the City of Oxnard 2030 General Plan and relevant Coastal Land Use Plan policies pursuant to Section 65401 of the Government Code. The Revised CIP includes equipment replacement at water and wastewater facilities and building repairs and security cameras at various City facilities. The additional proposed CIP projects are located throughout the City of Oxnard and vary in scope and funding. Filed by the City of Oxnard Public Works Department, 305 West Third Street - Third Floor, Oxnard, CA 93030.

City Staff: Tim Beaman, Supervising Civil Engineer; Joe Pearson, Planning and Environmental Services Manager

Recommendation: That the Planning Commission:

- a. Find the Revised Capital Improvement Program (CIP) projects for FY 2022-2027 is not a "project" under the California Environmental Quality Act pursuant to section 15601 (b)(3) and 15378(b)(4); and

In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need special assistance to participate in a meeting, you should contact the office of the City Clerk at (805) 385-7803. Notification 72 hours prior to the meeting will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements to assure accessibility to the meeting.

Written materials relating to an item on this agenda that are distributed to the Planning Commission within 72 hours before the item is to be considered at its regularly scheduled meeting will be made available for public inspection at 214 South C Street, during customary business hours.

- b. Adopt Resolution 2023-XX finding that the proposed additional Capital Improvement Program (CIP) projects for FY 2022-2027 are in conformance with the City of Oxnard 2030 General Plan and relevant Coastal Land Use Plan policies pursuant to Section 65401 of the Government Code.

Please click the following link to view the required Measure M pre-recorded presentation video: <https://youtu.be/AkoKjLjBwBE>

G. STUDY SESSION/REPORTS

H. PLANNING COMMISSION BUSINESS

I. COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT STAFF UPDATES

J. ADJOURNMENT

In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need special assistance to participate in a meeting, you should contact the office of the City Clerk at (805) 385-7803. Notification 72 hours prior to the meeting will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements to assure accessibility to the meeting.

Written materials relating to an item on this agenda that are distributed to the Planning Commission within 72 hours before the item is to be considered at its regularly scheduled meeting will be made available for public inspection at 214 South C Street, during customary business hours.

FUTURE MEETINGS

Regular Meeting: Thursday, May 4, 2023, 6:00 p.m., Council Chambers

In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need special assistance to participate in a meeting, you should contact the office of the City Clerk at (805) 385-7803. Notification 72 hours prior to the meeting will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements to assure accessibility to the meeting.

Written materials relating to an item on this agenda that are distributed to the Planning Commission within 72 hours before the item is to be considered at its regularly scheduled meeting will be made available for public inspection at 214 South C Street, during customary business hours.

<http://www.oxnard.org>

MINUTES
OXNARD PLANNING COMMISSION
Thursday, January 19, 2023

A. ROLL CALL

1. At 6:03 p.m., the Oxnard Planning Commission convened in the Oxnard Chambers.
2. Chair Chavez, Vice-Chair Arruejo, and Commissioners Stewart, Nash, and Lopez were present. Commissioners Connelly and Zielsdorf were absent.
3. Staff members present were; Ken Rozell, Chief Assistant City Attorney; Joe Pearson II, Planning Environmental Services Manager; and Miriam Loera, Administrative Services Specialist.
4. Chair Chavez presided and called the meeting to order.
5. Welcome to Commissioner Stewart.

B. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE TO THE FLAG OF THE UNITED STATES

1. Commissioner Stewart led the pledge of allegiance

C. PUBLIC COMMENTS - On Items Not On The Agenda

1. None

D. CONSENT AGENDA

1. None

E. NOMINATIONS AND ELECTIONS

1. Nomination and Election of the Planning Commission Chair and Vice Chair to Serve for Calendar Year 2023

CHAIR NOMINATIONS:

Commissioner Nash moved and Commissioner Stewart seconded a nomination for Vice Chair Arruejo to serve as Chair for Calendar year 2023.

VOTE:

Vice Chair Arruejo, Chair Chavez and Commissioners Dr. Lopez, Stewart and Nash voted in favor. Commissioners Connelly and Zielsdorf were absent. The motion carried 5:0:2:0:0¹.

VICE CHAIR NOMINATIONS:

¹ In Favor: Against: Absent: Abstain: Recused

Commissioner Nash moved and Commissioner Dr. Lopez seconded a nomination for Commissioner Stewart to serve as Vice Chair for Calendar year 2023.

VOTE:

Chair Arruejo, and Commissioners Stewart, Dr. Lopez, Chavez and Nash voted in favor. Commissioners Connelly and Zielsdorf were absent. The motion carried 5:0:2:0:0².

F. EX PARTE DECLARATIONS FOR PUBLIC HEARING ITEMS

1. None of the Planning Commissioners had any ex parte communications to report for Item G-1, G-2, and G-3.

G. PUBLIC HEARING

1. **Project Name: Freeway Adjacent Digital Display Billboards Ordinance - PLANNING AND ZONING PERMIT No. 20-580-06 (Zoning Text Amendment);** A request to modify Oxnard City Code (OCC) Chapter 16 (Zoning Code) Pertaining To The Permitting And Development Requirements Related To Freeway Adjacent Digital Display Billboards To OCC Chapter 16, Article II, Sections 16-596 (Sign Definitions), Sec. 16-608. Signs In General Commercial And Industrial Zones, Sec. 16-609. Freeway Adjacent Digital Display Billboards, And Sec. 16-610. General Restrictions.. Filed by the City of Oxnard, 214 S C Street, Oxnard, CA 93030.

City Staff: Joe Pearson II, Planning and Environmental Services Manager

Recommendation: That the Planning Commission

- a. Adopt Resolution 2023-01 recommending that the City Council adopt a Mitigated Negative Declaration (MND) 22-01; and
- b. Adopt Resolution 2023-02 recommending that the City Council approve Planning and Zoning Permit No. 20-580-06 (Ordinance Amendment).

Please click the following link to view the required Measure M pre-recorded presentation video: <https://youtu.be/g-Ee5eNGih0>

City Staff and Consultants Including: Joe Pearson II, Planning & Environmental Services Manager, Ken Rozell, Chief Assistant City Attorney, Michael E. Houlihan, AICP, CEQA Consultant with ESA, and Daryl Koutnik, PH.D, Senior Biologist, ESA were available for questions.

Lars Skugstad, the Applicant and Michael Schrupp, Lighting Consultant (EXP) presented his powerpoint presentation.

Verbal comments and questions were received by Commissioner Nash, Dr. Lopez, Chavez,

² In Favor: Against: Absent: Abstain: Recused

Chair Arruejo and Vice Chair Stewart and regarding several topics including: why is the ordinance needed, penalties of the agreement if any, public benefits, censorship, sign height, environmental analysis, lighting and safety. .

Chair Arruejo opened the public comments portion of the public hearing.

Public verbal comment received by Darron Baida opposing the project.

Chair Arruejo closed the public comments portion of the public hearing.

Discussion ensued among the Commissioners and staff about several topics, including: location, traffic safety, lighting and height.

PROCEDURAL MOTION:

Commissioner Chavez moved and Chair Arruejo seconded the motion to end debate on Item G-1.

PROCEDURAL MOTION VOTE:

Chair Arruejo, Vice Chair Stewart, Commissioners Connelly, Lopez, Nash and Chavez voted in favor. Commissioners Connelly and Zielsdorf were absent. The motion carried 5:2:2:0:0³.

MOTION:

Commissioner Chavez moved and Vice Chair Stewart seconded a motion to Adopt Resolution 2023-02 recommending that the City Council approve Planning and Zoning Permit No. 20-580-06 (Ordinance Amendment), with the following amendments:

1. Allow for Freeway Adjacent Digital Display Billboards to be erected on City of Oxnard owned property or Right of Way, in any non-residential zones located within five hundred (500) feet of the freeway right-of-way for US Highway 101, instead of only four hundred (400) feet.
2. Decrease the maximum number of Freeway Adjacent Digital Display Billboards from five (5) to three (3).
3. Increase the separation between Freeway Adjacent Digital Display Billboards from 2000 feet to 2500 feet.
4. Increase the minimum required residential setback from one hundred (100) feet to two hundred and fifty (250) feet.
5. Increase the minimum display time of each still image from eight (8) seconds to Twelve (12) seconds.

VOTE:

Chair Arruejo, Vice Chair Stewart and Commissioner Chavez. Commissioner Lopez and Nash voted No. Commissioners Connelly and Zielsdorf were absent. The motion carried 3:2:2:0:0⁴.

³ In Favor: Against: Absent: Abstain: Recused

⁴ In Favor: Against: Absent: Abstain: Recused

MOTION:

Chair Arruejo moved and Commissioner Chavez seconded the motion to Adopt Resolution 2023-01 recommending that the City Council adopt a Mitigated Negative Declaration (MND) 22-01

VOTE:

Chair Arruejo, Vice Chair Stewart, and Commissioners Lopez, Nash and Chavez voted No. Commissioners Connelly and Zielsdorf were absent. Motion did not failed 2:3:2:0:0⁵.

2. **Project Name: Riverpark Boulevard Electronic Billboard Project;** PLANNING AND ZONING PERMIT Nos. 20-500-07 (Special Use Permit), 20-670-06 (Development Agreement), and 20-630-02 (Specific Plan Amendment); A Special Use Permit, Development Agreement, and Specific Plan Amendment to allow for the installation and operation of an electronic billboard on an approximately 0.25 acre undeveloped site located between the U.S. 101 and Riverpark Boulevard approximately 850 feet north of Vineyard Avenue in the northern portion of the City of Oxnard (APN: 132-0-311-075). The Special Use Permit allows for the development of an electronic billboard that would include a digital display of advertisements of various businesses, activities, services or products and minor landscape improvements within the adjacent Caltrans right of way. The proposed Development Agreement will allow for the use of City property for the purpose of a Freeway Adjacent Digital Display Billboard and outline the required public benefits to be provided by the future development. The proposed Specific Plan Amendment would amend the RiverPark Specific Plan to allow for Freeway Adjacent Digital Display Billboards within the RiverPark Specific Plan. Filed by Lars Skugstad, 1111 Broadway, Suite 1515, Oakland, CA 94607 (the “Applicant”) on behalf of the City of Oxnard (the “Property Owner”).

City Staff: Joe Pearson II, Planning and Environmental Services Manager

Recommendation: That the Planning Commission:

- a. Adopt Resolution 2023-XX recommending that the City Council adopt a Mitigated Negative Declaration (MND) 22-02; and
- b. Adopt Resolution 2023-XX recommending that the City Council approve Planning and Zoning Permit No. 20-670-06 (Development Agreement), subject to certain findings; and
- c. Adopt Resolution 2023-XX recommending City Council approval of Planning and Zoning Permit No. 20-630-02 (Amendment to The RiverPark Specific Plan), subject to certain findings; and
- d. Adopt Resolution 2023-XX Approving Planning and Zoning Permit No. 20-500-07

⁵ In Favor: Against: Absent: Abstain: Recused

(Special Use Permit), subject to certain findings and conditions.

Please click the following link to view the required Measure M pre-recorded presentation video: <https://youtu.be/XWN-aBdXZQk>

City Staff and Consultants Including: Joe Pearson II, Planning & Environmental Services Manager, Ken Rozell, Chief Assistant City Attorney, Michael E. Houlihan, AICP, CEQA Consultant with ESA, and Daryl Koutnik, PH.D, Senior Biologist, ESA were available for questions.

Lars Skugstad, the Applicant, and Michael Schrupp, Lighting Engineer, presented their powerpoint presentation.

Verbal comments and questions were received by Commissioner Nash, Dr. Lopez, Chavez, Chair Arruejo and Vice Chair Stewart and regarding several topics including: Advertising for the City, lighting and brightness, distance from residential locations, rotation times, cost of future billboard removal.

Chair Arruejo opened the public comments portion of the public hearing.

Public verbal comment received by Darron Baida opposing the project.

Chair Arruejo closed the public comments portion of the public hearing.

Discussion ensued among the Commissioners and staff about several topics, including: endangered species, traffic safety, public safety, design and construction, light quality and aesthetics.

MOTION (MOTION OF INTENT TO DENY):

Commissioner Chavez moved and Commissioner Nash seconded a motion of Intent To Deny the Riverpark Boulevard Electronic Billboard Project, Planning And Zoning Permit Nos. 20-500-07 (Special Use Permit), 20-670-06 (Development Agreement), and 20-630-02 (Specific Plan Amendment) as the Planning Commission could not make the required findings, as specified in the deliberations provided by the Planning Commission, and to have staff return with formal Resolutions to Deny the project on February 2, 2023.

VOTE:

Chair Arruejo, Vice Chair Stewart, Commissioners Chavez, Dr. Lopez, and Nash. Commissioners Connelly and Zielsdorf were absent. The motion carried 5:0:2:0:0⁶.

- 3. Project Name: Ventura Road Electronic Billboard Project; PLANNING AND ZONING PERMIT** Nos. 20-500-06 (Special Use Permit), 20-670-05 (Development Agreement), and 21-660-03 (Street Vacation); A Special Use Permit, Development

⁶ In Favor: Against: Absent: Abstain: Recused

Agreement, and Street Vacation to allow for the installation and operation of an electronic billboard on an approximately 1,000-square foot undeveloped site located on the north side of the U.S. 101 and immediately west of Ventura Road in the northern portion of the City of Oxnard. The Special Use Permit allows for the development of an electronic billboard that would include a digital display of advertisements of various businesses, activities, services or products. The proposed Development Agreement will allow for the use of City property for the purpose of a Freeway Adjacent Digital Display Billboard and outline the required public benefits to be provided by the future development. The proposed Street Vacation would vacate the existing right-of-way to the City of Oxnard. Filed by Lars Skugstad, 1111 Broadway, Suite 1515, Oakland, CA 94607 (the “Applicant”) on behalf of the City of Oxnard (the “Property Owner”).

City Staff: Joe Pearson II, Planning and Environmental Services Manager

Recommendation: That the Planning Commission:

- a. Adopt Resolution 2023-XX recommending that the City Council adopt a Mitigated Negative Declaration (MND) 22-03; and
- b. Adopt Resolution 2023-XX recommending that the City Council approve Planning and Zoning Permit No. 20-670-05 (Development Agreement), subject to certain findings; and
- c. Adopt Resolution 2023-XX affirming that the City of Oxnard’s proposed Vacation of real property consisting of an approximately 1,000-square foot undeveloped site located on the north side of the U.S. 101 and immediately west of Ventura Road in the northern portion of the City of Oxnard is in conformance with the City of Oxnard 2030 General Plan and recommending that the City Council order the proceed with the vacation, subject to certain findings; and
- d. Adopt Resolution 2023-XX Approving Planning and Zoning Permit No. 20-500-06 (Special Use Permit), subject to certain findings and conditions.

Please click the following link to view the required Measure M pre-recorded presentation video: https://youtu.be/yUDvcKJ_Nm4

City Staff and Consultants Including: Joe Pearson II, Planning & Environmental Services Manager, Ken Rozell, Chief Assistant City Attorney, Michael E. Houlihan, AICP, CEQA Consultant with ESA, and Daryl Koutnik, PH.D, Senior Biologist, ESA were available for questions.

Lars Skugstad, the Applicant, and Michael Schrupp, Lighting Engineer, presented their powerpoint presentation.

Verbal comments and questions were received by Commissioner Nash, Dr. Lopez, Chavez, Chair Arruejo and Vice Chair Stewart and regarding several topics including: location, ecosystem concerns and lighting.

Chair Arruejo opened the public comments portion of the public hearing.

Public verbal comment received by Darron Baida opposing the project.

Chair Arruejo closed the public comments portion of the public hearing.

Discussion ensued among the Commissioners and staff about several topics, including: distance from apartment complexes in the area, traffic safety and lighting.

MAIN MOTION:

Commissioner Dr. Lopez moved and Commissioner Nash seconded a motion of Intent To Deny the Ventura Road Electronic Billboard Project, Planning And Zoning Permit Nos. 20-500-06 (Special Use Permit), 20-670-05 (Development Agreement), and 21-660-03 (Street Vacation) as the Planning Commission could not make the required findings, as specified in the deliberations provided by the Planning Commission, and to have staff return with formal Resolutions to Deny the project on February 2, 2023.

AMENDMENT TO THE MAIN MOTION:

Chair Arruejo moved and Vice Chair Stewart seconded motion to amend the main motion to include language that if the City Council rejects or amends the clause in regards to the 250 foot residence to a number below of allowing the adoption or approval to the staff recommendation that the Planning Commission would support staffs recommendation.

AMENDMENT TO THE MAIN MOTION VOTE:

Chair Arruejo, Vice Chair Stewart , and Commissioner Chavez. Dr. Lopez and Nash voted no. Commissioners Connelly and Zielsdorf were absent. The motion carried 3:2:2:0:0⁷

MAIN MOTION (MOTION OF INTENT TO DENY) VOTE:

Chair Arruejo, Vice Chair Stewart and Commissioner Chavez. Commissioner Dr. Lopez and Nash voted no. Commissioners Connelly and Zielsdorf were absent. The motion carried 3:2:2:0:0⁸

H. STUDY SESSION/REPORTS

1. None

I. PLANNING COMMISSION BUSINESS

1. Commissioner Chavez congratulated the new Chair Arruejo on his new position as Chair and thanked everyone for their support.

⁷ In Favor: Against: Absent: Abstain: Recused

⁸ In Favor: Against: Absent: Abstain: Recused

2. Commissioner Dr. Lopez echoed Commissioner Chavez and thanked him for his prior time serving as Chair and congratulated new Chair Arruejo and Vice Chair Stewart.
3. Chair Arruejo thanked Commissioner Chavez for his time served as Chair and shared his story on how he came to the City of Oxnard where he grew up most of his life.

J. COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT STAFF UPDATES

1. Joe Pearson II, Planning & Environmental Services Manager congratulated the new Chair and Vice Chair and thanked Commissioner Chavez for his past leadership and commented on the next Planning Commission meeting on February 2, 2023.
2. Ken Rozell, Chief Assistant City Attorney congratulated new Chair Arruejo and thanked Commissioner Chavez for his prior service as Chair.

K. ADJOURNMENT

1. At 9:45 p.m., the Planning Commission concurred to adjourn.

FUTURE MEETINGS

Regular Meeting: Thursday, February 2, 2023, 6:00 p.m., Oxnard Chambers

Ronald Arruejo,
Chair

ATTEST _____
Joe Pearson II,
Planning & Environmental Services Manager

MINUTES
OXNARD PLANNING COMMISSION
Thursday, February 2, 2023

A. ROLL CALL

1. At 6:02 p.m., the Oxnard Planning Commission convened in the Oxnard Chambers.
2. Chair Arruejo, Commissioners Chavez, Nash, Connelly, Zielsdorf and Lopez were present. Vice Chair Stewart was absent.
3. Staff members present were; Ken Rozell, Chief Assistant City Attorney; Joe Pearson II, Planning Environmental Services Manager; and Miriam Loera, Administrative Services Specialist.
4. Chair Arruejo presided and called the meeting to order.

B. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE TO THE FLAG OF THE UNITED STATES

1. Commissioner Zielsdorf led the pledge of allegiance

C. PUBLIC COMMENTS - On Items Not On The Agenda

1. City Councilman Gabe Teran addressing the Planning Commission and welcoming new members.

D. CONSENT AGENDA

1. APPROVAL OF MINUTES - October 20, 2022

MOTION:

Commissioner Chavez moved and Commissioner Connelly seconded the motion of approval of minutes for the October 20, 2022, Planning Commission meeting with the following amendments:

1. ~~Commissioner~~ Chair Chavez moved and Commissioner Zielsdorf seconded the motion to extend the meeting past 11:00 p.m.
2. Vice Chair Arruejo moved and Commissioner ~~Nash~~ Connelly seconded the motion to modify condition 57.
3. Include the following language for the vote on fourth motion (third amendment to main motion) vote: FOURTH MOTION (THIRD AMENDMENT TO MAIN MOTION) VOTE: Vice Chair Arruejo, and Commissioners Nash and Zielsdorf voted in favor. Chair Chavez Commissioner Connelly against. Commissioners Meyer and Dr. Lopez recused themselves. The motion carried 3:2:0:0:2.
4. Removal of Dr. Lopez vote on page four for second motion and page six on vote for the fourth motion.

VOTE:

Chair Arruejo, Commissioner Chavez, Dr. Lopez, Connelly, Nash and Zielsdorf. Vice Chair Stewart was absent. The motion carried 6:0:1:0:0¹.

2. APPROVAL OF MINUTES - January 5, 2023

MOTION:

Commissioner Chavez moved and Commissioner Dr. Lopez seconded the motion of approval of minutes for the January 5, 2023, Planning Commission meeting.

VOTE:

Chair Arruejo, Commissioner Chavez, Dr. Lopez, Connelly, Nash and Zielsdorf. Vice Chair Stewart was absent. The motion carried 6:0:1:0:0².

E. EX PARTE DECLARATIONS FOR PUBLIC HEARING ITEMS

1. NONE

F. PUBLIC HEARING

1. **Project Name: 2420 Oxnard Boulevard U-Haul Project** - - Planning and Zoning Permit No. 17-500-11 (Special Use Permit); Located at 2420 N. Oxnard Boulevard APNs: 142-0-010-345 and 142-0-021-010. The applicant requests a permit to allow for the renovation and conversion of an existing warehouse into a three story, 203,213 square feet of mini-warehouse/self-storage space, storage warehouse, and retail space on an 8.86-acre site. The large parking area on the north end of the lot would provide 46 covered recreational vehicle (RV) parking storage spaces. The request includes certification of the proposed Final Initial Study/Mitigated Negative Declaration (IS-MND) and adoption of the Mitigation Monitoring and Reporting Program (MMRP) which has been prepared pursuant to provisions of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Guidelines, Section 15063. Filed by David Randi, 2420 N Oxnard Blvd, Oxnard, CA 93036 (the “Applicant”) on behalf of Amerco Real Estate Co., 2727 N. Central Avenue, 5-N, Phoenix, Arizona 85004 (the “Property Owner”).

City Staff: Joe Pearson II, Planning & Environmental Services Manager and Michael Rocque, Senior Contract Planner

Recommendation: That the Planning Commission:

- a. Adopt Resolution No. 2023-03 recommending that the City Council adopt a Mitigated Negative Declaration (MND) 22-04 and Mitigation Monitoring Reporting Program (MMRP)
- b. Adopt Resolution 2023-04 recommending that the City Council Approve Planning and Zoning Permit No. 17-500-11 (Special Use Permit), based on the findings presented

¹ In Favor: Against: Absent: Abstain: Recused

² In Favor: Against: Absent: Abstain: Recused

and attached conditions of approval.

Micheal Rocque, Senior Contract Planner, provided the required Measure M pre-recorded presentation video outlining the request which was posted with the agenda: <https://youtu.be/xOx4F8ULdPQ>

City Staff and Consultants Including: Joe Pearson II, Planning & Environmental Services Manager, Michael Rocque, Senior Contract Planner, and Ken Rozell, Chief Assistant City Attorney were available for questions.

Mark Pettit the Applicant was also present and available for questions.

Verbal comments and questions were received by Commissioner Nash regarding solar panels.

Chair Arruejo opened the public comments portion of the public hearing.

Public verbal comment received by Pat Brown supporting the project.

Chair Arruejo closed the public comments portion of the public hearing.

MOTION:

Commissioner Nash moved and Commissioner Dr. Loppz seconded the motion to Adopt Resolution No. 2023-03 recommending that the City Council adopt a Mitigated Negative Declaration (MND) 22-04 and Mitigation Monitoring Reporting Program (MMRP) and adopt Resolution 2023-04 recommending that the City Council Approve Planning and Zoning Permit No. 17-500-11 (Special Use Permit), based on the findings presented and attached conditions of approval.

VOTE:

Chair Arruejo, Commissioner Dr. Lopez, Connelly, Nash and Zielsdorf. Commissioner Chavez voted No. Vice Chair Stewart was absent. The motion carried 5:1:1:0:0³

2. **Project Name: Riverpark Boulevard Electronic Billboard Project;** PLANNING AND ZONING PERMIT Nos. 20-500-07 (Special Use Permit), 20-670-06 (Development Agreement), and 20-630-02 (Specific Plan Amendment); A Special Use Permit, Development Agreement, and Specific Plan Amendment to allow for the installation and operation of an electronic billboard on an approximately 0.25 acre undeveloped site located between the U.S. 101 and Riverpark Boulevard approximately 850 feet north of Vineyard Avenue in the northern portion of the City of Oxnard (APN: 132-0-311-075). The Special Use Permit allows for the development of an electronic billboard that would include a digital display of advertisements of various businesses, activities, services or products and minor landscape improvements within the adjacent Caltrans right of way. The proposed Development Agreement will allow for the use of City property for the purpose of a

³ In Favor: Against: Absent: Abstain: Recused

Freeway Adjacent Digital Display Billboard and outline the required public benefits to be provided by the future development. The proposed Specific Plan Amendment would amend the RiverPark Specific Plan to allow for Freeway Adjacent Digital Display Billboards within the RiverPark Specific Plan. Filed by Lars Skugstad, 1111 Broadway, Suite 1515, Oakland, CA 94607 (the “Applicant”) on behalf of the City of Oxnard (the “Property Owner”).

City Staff: Joe Pearson II, Planning and Environmental Services Manager

Recommendation: That the Planning Commission:

- a. Adopt Resolution 2023-05 recommending that the City Council deny Mitigated Negative Declaration (MND) 22-02; and
- b. Adopt Resolution 2023-06 recommending that the City Council deny Planning and Zoning Permit No. 20-670-06 (Development Agreement), subject to certain findings; and
- c. Adopt Resolution 2023-07 recommending City Council deny Planning and Zoning Permit No. 20-630-02 (Amendment to The RiverPark Specific Plan), subject to certain findings; and
- d. Finds Planning and Zoning Permit No. 20-500-07 (Special Use Permit) to be Statutorily Exempt from environmental review pursuant to the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Guidelines Section 152070 (“Projects Which are Disapproved”); and
- e. Adopt Resolution 2023-08 Denying Planning and Zoning Permit No. 20-500-07 (Special Use Permit), subject to certain findings and conditions.

Joe Pearson II, Planning & Environmental Services Manager, provided the required Measure M pre-recorded presentation video outlining the request which was posted with the agenda: <https://youtu.be/XWN-aBdXZQk>

City Staff and Consultants Including: Joe Pearson II, Planning & Environmental Services Manager and Ken Rozell, Chief Assistant City Attorney were available for questions.

Lars Skugstad the Applicant was present and available for questions.

No Verbal comments and questions were received by Commissioners.

Chair Arruejo opened the public comments portion of the public hearing.

Public verbal comments received by Darron Baida and Pat Brown opposing the project.

Chair Arruejo closed the public comments portion of the public hearing.

Discussion ensued among the Commissioners and staff about several topics, including: revenue, traffic safety, location, and lighting.

MOTION:

Commissioner Nash moved and Commissioner Dr. Lopez seconded the motion to adopt Resolution 2023-05 recommending that the City Council deny Mitigated Negative Declaration (MND) 22-02; and adopt Resolution 2023-06 recommending that the City Council deny Planning and Zoning Permit No. 20-670-06 (Development Agreement), subject to certain findings; and adopt Resolution 2023-07 recommending City Council deny Planning and Zoning Permit No. 20-630-02 (Amendment to The RiverPark Specific Plan), subject to certain findings; and finds Planning and Zoning Permit No. 20-500-07 (Special Use Permit) to be Statutorily Exempt from environmental review pursuant to the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Guidelines Section 152070 (“Projects Which are Disapproved”); and adopt Resolution 2023-08 Denying Planning and Zoning Permit No. 20-500-07 (Special Use Permit), subject to certain findings and conditions.

VOTE:

Chair Arruejo, Commissioner, Chavez, Dr. Lopez, Connelly, Nash and Zielsdorf. Vice Chair Stewart was absent. The motion carried 6:0:1:0:0⁴.

- 3. Project Name: Ventura Road Electronic Billboard Project;** PLANNING AND ZONING PERMIT Nos. 20-500-06 (Special Use Permit), 20-670-05 (Development Agreement), and 21-660-03 (Street Vacation); A Special Use Permit, Development Agreement, and Street Vacation to allow for the installation and operation of an electronic billboard on an approximately 1,000-square foot undeveloped site located on the north side of the U.S. 101 and immediately west of Ventura Road in the northern portion of the City of Oxnard. The Special Use Permit allows for the development of an electronic billboard that would include a digital display of advertisements of various businesses, activities, services or products. The proposed Development Agreement will allow for the use of City property for the purpose of a Freeway Adjacent Digital Display Billboard and outline the required public benefits to be provided by the future development. The proposed Street Vacation would vacate the existing right-of-way to the City of Oxnard. Filed by Lars Skugstad, 1111 Broadway, Suite 1515, Oakland, CA 94607 (the “Applicant”) on behalf of the City of Oxnard (the “Property Owner”).

City Staff: Joe Pearson II, Planning and Environmental Services Manager

Recommendation: That the Planning Commission:

- a. Adopt Resolution 2023-09 recommending that the City Council deny Mitigated Negative Declaration (MND) 22-03; and
- b. Adopt Resolution 2023-10 recommending that the City Council deny Planning and Zoning Permit No. 20-670-05 (Development Agreement), subject to certain findings; and
- c. Adopt Resolution 2023-11 recommending City Council deny Planning and Zoning

⁴ In Favor: Against: Absent: Abstain: Recused

Permit No. 21-660-03 (Street Vacation), subject to certain findings; and

- d. Finds Planning and Zoning Permit No. 20-500-06 (Special Use Permit) to be Statutorily Exempt from environmental review pursuant to the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Guidelines Section 15270 (“Projects Which are Disapproved”); and
- e. Adopt Resolution 2023-12 Denying Planning and Zoning Permit No. 20-500-06 (Special Use Permit), subject to certain findings and conditions.

Joe Pearson II, Planning & Environmental Services Manager, provided the required Measure M pre-recorded presentation video outlining the request which was posted with the agenda: https://youtu.be/yUDvcKJ_Nm4

City Staff and Consultants Including: Joe Pearson II, Planning & Environmental Services Manager and Ken Rozell, Chief Assistant City Attorney were available for questions.

Lars Skugstad the Applicant was present and available for questions.

No Verbal comments or questions were received by Commissioners.

Chair Arruejo opened the public comments portion of the public hearing.

Public verbal comment received by Darron Baida opposing the project.

Chair Arruejo closed the public comments portion of the public hearing.

Discussion ensued among the Commissioners and staff about several topics, including: cost of future removal of billboards, types of advertisements, view of location, and legal agreement.

MOTION:

Chair Arruejo and Commissioner Nash seconded the motion to adopt Resolution 2023-09 recommending that the City Council deny Mitigated Negative Declaration (MND) 22-03; and adopt Resolution 2023-10 recommending that the City Council deny Planning and Zoning Permit No. 20-670-05 (Development Agreement), subject to certain findings; and adopt Resolution 2023-11 recommending City Council deny Planning and Zoning Permit No. 21-660-03 (Street Vacation), subject to certain findings; and finds Planning and Zoning Permit No. 20-500-06 (Special Use Permit) to be Statutorily Exempt from environmental review pursuant to the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Guidelines Section 15270 (“Projects Which are Disapproved”); and adopt Resolution 2023-12 Denying Planning and Zoning Permit No. 20-500-06 (Special Use Permit), subject to certain findings and conditions.

VOTE:

Chair Arruejo, Commissioner Chavez, Dr. Lopez, Connelly, Nash and

Zielsdorf. Vice Chair Stewart was absent. The motion carried 6:0:1:0:0⁵.

4. **Project Name: 940 Dunes Duplex;** Planning and Zoning Permit No. 22-400-01 (Coastal Development Permit) to authorize the construction of a residential duplex totaling 5,591 square-feet, located at 940 Dunes (APN: 196-0-031-155). A request to construct a two-story 5,591 square-foot residential duplex building consisting of two, attached two-bedroom dwelling units on a 6,366 square-foot vacant lot. Unit 1, which is 2,910 square feet, includes an 881 square foot garage and 257 square feet of balcony area. Unit 2 is 2,681 square feet and includes an 890 square foot garage and a 108 square foot balcony.
City Staff: Joe Pearson II, Planning & Environmental Services Manager

Recommendation: That the Planning Commission:

- a. Find the Project to be Categorically Exempt from environmental review pursuant to the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Guidelines Section 15303 (New Construction or Conversion of Small Structures); and
- b. Adopt Resolution 2023-13 approving Planning and Zoning Permit No. 22-400-01 (Coastal Development Permit), subject to certain findings and conditions.

Joe Pearson II, Planning & Environmental Services Manager, provided the required Measure M pre-recorded presentation video outlining the request which was posted with the agenda: <https://youtu.be/w71xS3JEsMQ>

City Staff and Consultants Including: Joe Pearson II, Planning & Environmental Services Manager and Ken Rozell, Chief Assistant City Attorney Susan Hernandez, Contract Planner were available for questions.

The Applicant Alex Muller was available for questions.

No Verbal comments or questions were received by Commissioners.

Chair Arruejo opened the public comments portion of the public hearing.

No Public verbal comment received

Chair Arruejo closed the public comments portion of the public hearing.

MOTION:

Commissioner Dr. Lopez and Commissioner Connelly seconded the motion to adopt find the Project to be Categorically Exempt from environmental review pursuant to the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Guidelines Section 15303 (New Construction or Conversion of Small Structures); and adopt Resolution 2023-13 approving Planning and Zoning Permit No.

⁵ In Favor: Against: Absent: Abstain: Recused

22-400-01 (Coastal Development Permit), subject to certain findings and conditions.

VOTE:

Chair Arruejo, Commissioner Chavez, Dr. Lopez, Connelly, Nash and Zielsdorf. Vice Chair Stewart was absent. The motion carried 6:0:1:0:0⁶.

G. STUDY SESSION/REPORTS

1. None

H. PLANNING COMMISSION BUSINESS

1. Commissioner Chavez commented on Metrolink offering free rides on February 4, 2023 due to Equity Day and announced the beginning of Black History month.
2. Chair Arruejo thanked the Planning Commission for his new appointment as Chair and outlook on the Planning Commission; he also commented on the Institute for Local Government offering free training on February 17th, 2023 for the 2022-2023 Regional Planning Commissioner Training.

I. COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT STAFF UPDATES

1. Joe Pearson II addressed the upcoming meeting for February 16, 2023 which will consist of only one item.

J. ADJOURNMENT

1. At 7:00 p.m., the Planning Commission concurred to adjourn.

FUTURE MEETINGS

Regular Meeting: Thursday, February 16, 2023, 6:00 p.m., Oxnard Chambers

Ronald Arruejo,
Chair

ATTEST _____
Joe Pearson II,
Planning & Environmental Services Manager

⁶ In Favor: Against: Absent: Abstain: Recused