

CITY OF OXNARD PLANNING COMMISSION AGENDA

REGULAR MEETING
Council Chambers, 305 West Third Street
Thursday, December 7, 2023, 6:00 p.m.

The public may view the meeting from home on the City's website at Oxnard.org/city-meetings, Spectrum Channel 10, Frontier Channel 35, or YouTube at Youtube.com/oxnardnews. Video recordings are typically available online following the meeting at the City's website at <http://www.oxnard.org/city-meetings>

YOU MAY PARTICIPATE IN THE MEETING IN THE FOLLOWING WAYS:

1. ATTEND THE MEETING AT THE LOCATION LISTED ABOVE: Submit a speaker card.
2. EMAILING COMMENTS OR REQUESTS TO SPEAK BEFORE THE MEETING
 - a. Submit an email to Planning@oxnard.org no later than 3:00 p.m. on the day of the meeting (Please indicate the agenda item number in the subject line). All email correspondence will be forwarded to the Planning Commission prior to the start of the meeting and made part of the legislative record.
 - b. Submit a request to speak by no later than 3pm on the day of the meeting by using the form <https://forms.gle/zR57qBNTRYbqzEpL6>, emailing the Planning office at planning@oxnard.org, or calling (805) 385-7858.
3. PROVIDING PUBLIC COMMENTS DURING THE MEETING
 - a. Speakers shall have up to three minutes to speak.
 - b. If you wish to speak during public comments or a particular item on the agenda, please follow the below instructions:
 1. Dial phone number (888) 475-4499
 2. Enter the meeting ID: 852 9698 4003
 3. Enter the meeting passcode: 467497
 4. Wait in the Zoom waiting room. Once the Chair calls for public speakers, press *9 to raise your hand to inform the recording secretary you would like to speak.
 - c. Public comments on items not on the agenda shall be taken at the beginning of the meeting. If there are more speakers than can be accommodated during thirty minutes, additional speakers who will be given an opportunity to speak at the end of the meeting.
 - d. Public comments on items on the agenda shall be taken following the announcement of the item.

In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need special assistance to participate in a meeting, you should contact the office of the City Clerk at (805) 385-7803. Notification 72 hours prior to the meeting will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements to assure accessibility to the meeting.

Written materials relating to an item on this agenda that are distributed to the Planning Commission within 72 hours before the item is to be considered at its regularly scheduled meeting will be made available for public inspection at 214 South C Street, during customary business hours.

A. ROLL CALL**B. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE TO THE FLAG OF THE UNITED STATES****C. PUBLIC COMMENTS - On Items Not On The Agenda**

At this time, a person may address the Planning Commission on matters within the jurisdiction of the Planning Commission, including information/consent items and any item not appearing on the agenda. The Chair shall limit public comments to three (3) minutes. The Planning Commission cannot take action on any item presented during public comments that is not on the agenda and such item may only be referred to the Commission Secretary. Persons wishing to speak on public hearing items should do so at the time of the public hearing.

D. CONSENT AGENDA

1. APPROVAL OF MINUTES - September 21, 2023
2. APPROVAL OF MINUTES - October 19, 2023
3. APPROVAL OF MINUTES - November 2, 2023
4. APPROVAL OF MINUTES - November 16, 2023
5. Adoption of the 2024 Planning Commission Meeting Calendar

E. EX PARTE DECLARATIONS FOR PUBLIC HEARING ITEMS**F. PUBLIC HEARING**

1. **Project Name:** **Project Name: Camino Del Sol Wireless Monopine;** Planning and Zoning Permit No. 23-530-01 (Special Use Permit - Wireless); Property located at 2473 Camino Del Sol (APN: 214-0-012-195). A request to construct a 60-foot tall wireless communication facility designed to resemble a pine tree with an associated ground equipment enclosure on a 2.41 acre lot in the M-1 zone. The request includes the allowance for an increase in height from 55 feet to 60 feet. The project is Categorically Exempt in accordance with Section 15303 pursuant to provisions of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Guidelines. Filed by designated agent Lynda McClung, Network Connex, 655 N. Central Ave. Suite 1520, Glendale, CA 95757 on behalf of Anthemnet and Verizon Wireless , on behalf of the property owner Beardsley & Son, Inc, 2473 Camino Del Sol, Oxnard, CA 93030.

City Staff: Daniel Houck, Associate Planner

Recommendation: That the Planning Commission:

In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need special assistance to participate in a meeting, you should contact the office of the City Clerk at (805) 385-7803. Notification 72 hours prior to the meeting will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements to assure accessibility to the meeting.

Written materials relating to an item on this agenda that are distributed to the Planning Commission within 72 hours before the item is to be considered at its regularly scheduled meeting will be made available for public inspection at 214 South C Street, during customary business hours.

- a. Find the project Exempt from environmental review pursuant to the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Guidelines Section 15303 Class 3 (New Construction); and
- b. Adopt Resolution 2023-XX approving Planning and Zoning Permit No. 23-530-01 (Special Use Permit Wireless), subject to certain findings and conditions.

Please click the following link to view the required Measure M pre-recorded presentation video : <https://youtu.be/A8huWA0e0i4>

2. **Project Name: Beverage House Market;** Planning and Zoning Permit No. 23-510-02 (Special Use Permit-Alcohol); Property located at 1955 South Patterson Road; (APN 187-0-112-575). A request to allow for the change from a Alcohol Beverage Control (ABC) License Type 20 to a ABC License Type 21 - Off-Sale General to allow the sales of beer, wine, and distilled spirits for consumption off the premises. The facility proposes to operate Sunday through Thursday from 7:00 A.M. to 11:00 P.M. and 7:00 A.M. to 12:00 A.M. on Fridays & Saturdays. The project is exempt from environmental review pursuant to Section 15301 (Existing Facilities), Class 1 of the California Environmental Quality Act Guidelines. Filed by Steve Rawling on behalf of Beverage House Market, Business Owner, 26023 Jefferson Avenue, Suite D, Murrieta, CA 92562.

City Staff: Alex Tellez, Assistant Planner

Recommendation: That the Planning Commission:

- a. Find the Project to be Categorically Exempt from environmental review pursuant to the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Guidelines Section 15301 (Existing Facilities); and
- b. Adopt Resolution 2023-XX approving Planning and Zoning Permit No. 23-510-02 (Special Use Permit - Alcohol), subject to certain findings and conditions.

Please click the following link to view the required Measure M pre-recorded presentation video: <https://youtu.be/NZfbS0V2gTM>

3. **Project Name: Starbucks at Lemon Grove Plaza;** Planning and Zoning Permit No. 21-500-09 (Special Use Permit), Property Located at 2001-2009 N. Oxnard Blvd (APNs: 139-0-070-860, -870, -810). A request to construct a 2,353 square-foot coffee cafe with drive through within an existing commercial shopping center parking lot. The proposed building would increase the total building square footage on the property from 99,903 to approximately 102,900 and would reduce the parking from 475 parking spaces to 462. The project is exempt from environmental review pursuant to Sections 15303(c) (Class 3, New

In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need special assistance to participate in a meeting, you should contact the office of the City Clerk at (805) 385-7803. Notification 72 hours prior to the meeting will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements to assure accessibility to the meeting.

Written materials relating to an item on this agenda that are distributed to the Planning Commission within 72 hours before the item is to be considered at its regularly scheduled meeting will be made available for public inspection at 214 South C Street, during customary business hours.

Construction Or Conversion Of Small Structures) and 15332 (Class 32, In-fill Development Projects). The project was filed by Scott Boydstun (Rasmussen & Associates) 21 South California Street, 4th floor, Ventura, CA 93001 on behalf of property owner James Aston (Lemon Grove Plaza, Inc) 1014 South Westlake Boulevard, Suite 14-245 Westlake Village, Ca 91361.

City Staff: Joe Pearson II, Planning Manager and Susan Hernandez, Contract Planner

Recommendation: That the Planning Commission:

- a. Find the project to be Categorically Exempt from environmental review pursuant to the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Guidelines Sections 15303(c) (Class 3, New Construction Or Conversion Of Small Structures) and 15332 (Class 32, In-fill Development Projects); and
- b. Adopt Resolution 2023-XX approving Planning and Zoning Permit No. 21-500-09 (Special Use Permit), subject to certain findings and conditions.

Please click the following link to view the required Measure M pre-recorded presentation video: <https://youtu.be/EZXbJMGoe9s>

G. STUDY SESSION/REPORTS

H. PLANNING COMMISSION BUSINESS

I. COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT STAFF UPDATES

J. ADJOURNMENT

FUTURE MEETINGS

Regular Meeting: Thursday, December 21, 2023, 6:00 p.m., Council Chambers

In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need special assistance to participate in a meeting, you should contact the office of the City Clerk at (805) 385-7803. Notification 72 hours prior to the meeting will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements to assure accessibility to the meeting.

Written materials relating to an item on this agenda that are distributed to the Planning Commission within 72 hours before the item is to be considered at its regularly scheduled meeting will be made available for public inspection at 214 South C Street, during customary business hours.

<http://www.oxnard.org>

In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need special assistance to participate in a meeting, you should contact the office of the City Clerk at (805) 385-7803. Notification 72 hours prior to the meeting will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements to assure accessibility to the meeting.

Written materials relating to an item on this agenda that are distributed to the Planning Commission within 72 hours before the item is to be considered at its regularly scheduled meeting will be made available for public inspection at 214 South C Street, during customary business hours.

<http://www.oxnard.org>

DRAFT MINUTES
OXNARD PLANNING COMMISSION
Thursday, September 21, 2023

A. ROLL CALL

1. At 6:00pm the Oxnard Planning Commission convened in the Oxnard Chambers.
2. Chair Arruejo, Vice Chair Dr. Stewart, Commissioners Connelly, Dr. Lopez, Nash and Zielsdorf were present. Commissioner Chavez was absent.
3. Staff members present were: Joe Pearson II, Planning & Environmental Services Manager; Ken Rozell, Chief Assistant City Attorney; and Miriam Loera, Administration Services Specialist.
4. Chair Arruejo presided and called the meeting to order.

B. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE TO THE FLAG OF THE UNITED STATES

1. Chair Arruejo

C. PUBLIC COMMENTS - On Items Not On The Agenda

1. None

D. CONSENT AGENDA

1. None

E. EX PARTE DECLARATIONS FOR PUBLIC HEARING ITEMS

1. None

F. PUBLIC HEARING

1. **Project Name: 6001 Arcturus Avenue Outdoor Storage Yard Project;** Planning and Zoning Permit No. 22-500-01 (Special Use Permit) and 22-400-02 (Coastal Development Permit); Development proposal to construct a parking lot and outdoor storage yard. The 8.7-acre site will operate as a storage facility for containers and cars. The applicant is requesting a Special Use Permit and Coastal Development Permit to redevelop the 8.7-acre property located at 6001 Arcturus Avenue (APN: 231-0-092-215). The project would feature a total of 352,501 sf of paved parking, 27,038 sf of landscaping, 38 overhead lights, four (4) fire hydrants, and a bioswale and storm drain on the southern edge of the parking lot. No new buildings are proposed. Filed by Tanner Shelton, Jensen Design & Survey, Inc., 1672 Donlon Street, Ventura, California 93003, designated agent (the “Applicant”) on behalf of RJN Properties, LLC & Hager Pacific 1, LP, 4100 Newport Place, Ste. 700 Newport Beach, CA 92660 (the “Property Owner”).

In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need special assistance to participate in a meeting, you should contact the office of the City Clerk at (805) 385-7803. Notification 72 hours prior to the meeting will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements to assure accessibility to the meeting.

Written materials relating to an item on this agenda that are distributed to the Planning Commission within 72 hours before the item is to be considered at its regularly scheduled meeting will be made available for public inspection at 214 South C Street, during customary business hours.

City Staff: Brenna Wengert, AICP, Contract Planner and Joe Pearson II, Planning Environmental Services Manager

Recommendation: That the Planning Commission:

- a. Adopt Resolution 2023-32 certifying Final Initial Study/Mitigated Negative Declaration (IS/MND) No. 23-01; and
- b. Adopt Resolution 2023-31 approving Planning and Zoning Permit No. 22-500-01 (Special Use Permit) and 22-400-02 (Coastal Development Permit), subject to certain findings and conditions.

Brenna Wengert, AICP, Contract Planner provided the required Measure M pre-recorded presentation video outlining the request which was posted with the agenda: <https://youtu.be/CBxKWHskJgg>

City Staff and Consultants Including: Joe Pearson II, Planning & Environmental Services Manager; Ken Rozell, Chief Assistant City Attorney; Breanna Wengert, AICP (CSG Consultants); Jonathan V. Leech, AICP (Dudek); and Lulia Roman (Dudek) were available for questions.

The applicant team included: Tanner Shelton of Jensen Design & Survey, Inc. and Rob Neal of Hagar Pacific were available for questions.

Verbal comments and questions were received by Commissioners : Vice Chair Dr. Stewart, Chair Arruejo, Commissioners Nash and Lopez on Community Workshop discussions, trash enclosures requirements/standards, contents of containers, steel security fence, MND, travel path for vehicles and trucks, the hours of operations, need for trees and concern regarding the number of trees, landscaping, industrial projects in the area and coastal zone along with a climate action plan and outdoor lighting impacts were discussed.

Chair Arruejo opened the public comments portion of the public hearing.

No verbal comments were received by public speakers

Chair Arruejo closed the public comments portion of the public hearing.

Discussion ensued among the Commissioners and staff about several topics, including: air pollution, native plant placement in place of trees, landscaping, light standards, security, hours of operation, bird spikes on fence, and future zoning for South Oxnard.

MOTION:

Chair Arruejo moved and Vice Chair Dr. Stewart seconded the motion to adopt Resolution 2023-32 certifying Final Initial Study/Mitigated Negative Declaration (IS/MND) No. 23-01; and adopt Resolution 2023-31 approving Planning and Zoning Permit No. 22-500-01 (Special Use Permit) and 22-400-02 (Coastal Development Permit), subject to certain findings and conditions with the following amendments:

1. Add New Landscape Special Condition; “All plants shall be either native or drought tolerant. Trees shall not exceed the minimum number as required by the City.”
2. Modify Condition 36 as follows: Project on-site lighting shall be of a type and in a location that does not constitute a hazard to vehicular traffic, either on private property or on adjoining streets. To prevent damage from vehicles, standards in parking areas shall be mounted on reinforced concrete pedestals or otherwise protected. Developer shall recess or conceal under-canopy lighting elements so as not to be directly visible from a public street. Developer shall submit a lighting plan showing standard heights and light materials for design review and approval of the Planning Division Manager. Light standards shall be modified so as to not allow perching by raptors or other predatory-type birds through use of bird-spikes or other bird-deterrent devices. (PL/B, PL-8)
3. Modify Condition 56 as follows: Hours of Operation shall be between ~~6~~7:00 AM and 6:00 PM Monday through Friday.

MOTION VOTE:

Chair Arruejo, Vice Chair Dr. Stewart, Commissioners Zielsdorf and Nash voted in favor. Dr. Lopez and Connelly voted against. Commissioner Chavez was absent. The motion carried 4:2:1:0:0¹.

F. STUDY SESSION/REPORTS

1. None

G. PLANNING COMMISSION BUSINESS

1. Chair Arruejo thanked and appreciated Vice Chair Dr. Stewart for covering the prior meeting during his absence. He shared he is now a registered Parliamentarian and his experience at the convention/conference he attended.

¹ In Favor: Against: Absent: Abstain: Recused

2. Vice Chair Dr. Stewart thanked the Commission for being supportive and addressed his new Doctorate degree credential.

H. COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT STAFF UPDATES

1. Joe Pearson II commented on the upcoming meeting and the items that will be presented he also addressed the news of the new Community Development Director Jeff Pengilley.

I. ADJOURNMENT

1. At 7:15pm., the Planning Commission concurred to adjourn.

FUTURE MEETINGS

Regular Meeting: Thursday, October 5, 2023, 6:00 p.m, Oxnard Chambers

Ronald Arruejo,
Chair

ATTEST _____
Joe Pearson II,
Planning & Environmental Services Manager

DRAFT MINUTES
OXNARD PLANNING COMMISSION
Thursday, October 19, 2023

A. ROLL CALL

1. At 6:00pm the Oxnard Planning Commission convened in the Oxnard Chambers.
2. Chair Arruejo, Vice Chair Dr. Stewart, Commissioners Chavez, Dr. Lopez, Nash and Zielsdorf were present. Commissioner Connelly was absent.
3. Staff members present were: Joe Pearson II, Planning & Environmental Services Manager; Ken Rozell, Chief Assistant City Attorney; Serena Gonzalez, Assistant Planner; and Miriam Loera, Administration Services Specialist.
4. Chair Arruejo presided and called the meeting to order.

B. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE TO THE FLAG OF THE UNITED STATES

1. Commissioner Chavez

C. PUBLIC COMMENTS - On Items Not On The Agenda

1. None

D. CONSENT AGENDA

1. None

E. EX PARTE DECLARATIONS FOR PUBLIC HEARING ITEMS

1. Chair Arruejo made a site visit to the appellants home to view the proposed location of the hot tub.

F. PUBLIC HEARING

1. **Project Name: Appeal of 1215 Capri Way Amendment;** PLANNING AND ZONING PERMIT No. 23-400-01 (Coastal Development Permit); Located at 1215 Capri Way (APN 191-0-091-285; Lot 57 of Tract No. 4380). Appeal of the Community Development Director's decision to deny a request for a Coastal Development Permit (CDP) Amendment in order to remove the condition that prohibits a rooftop spa and allow for the placement of a spa on the existing roof deck of a beachfront single-family residence. The project site is a 5,284 square-foot beachfront home within the Oxnard Shores Neighborhood in the Beachfront Residential (R-BF) zoning district and the Coastal Zone. The proposed project is exempt from environmental review, pursuant to CEQA Guidelines Section 15270 ("Projects Which are Disapproved") of the California Environmental Quality Act. Filed by property owner Ben and Michelle Mandelbaum.

In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need special assistance to participate in a meeting, you should contact the office of the City Clerk at (805) 385-7803. Notification 72 hours prior to the meeting will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements to assure accessibility to the meeting.

Written materials relating to an item on this agenda that are distributed to the Planning Commission within 72 hours before the item is to be considered at its regularly scheduled meeting will be made available for public inspection at 214 South C Street, during customary business hours.

City Staff: Serena Gonzalez, Assistant Planner

Recommendation: That the Planning Commission:

- a. Find the Project to be Statutorily Exempt from the requirements of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) pursuant to CEQA Guidelines Section 15270 (“Projects Which are Disapproved”); and
- b. Adopt a Resolution 2023-33 denying the Appeal and upholding the Community Development Director’s Denial of Planning and Zoning Permit No. 23-400-01 (Coastal Development Permit).

Serena Gonzalez, Assistant Planner provided the required Measure M pre-recorded presentation video outlining the request which was posted with the agenda: <https://youtu.be/xn6NsjSmnSQ>

City Staff and Consultants Including: Joe Pearson, Planning & Environmental Services Manager; Ken Rozell, Chief Assistant City Attorney; and Serena Gonzalez, Assistant Planner were available for questions.

The applicant team including: Fred Gaines, Gary Rosen, Ben Mandelbaum, and Michelle Mandelbaum gave a presentation and were available for questions.

MAIN MOTION:

Commissioner Nash moved and Vice Chair Dr. Stewart seconded the motion to increase the speaking of the applicant time from default of ten minutes to twelve minutes.

AMENDMENT TO THE MAIN MOTION:

Vice Chair Stewart moved and Commissioner Nash seconded a motion to amend the main motion to increase the speaking time of the applicant from default time of ten minutes to fifteen minutes.

AMENDMENT TO THE MAIN MOTION VOTE:

Vice Chair Stewart, Commissioners Dr. Lopez, Nash and Zielsdorf voted in favor. Chair Arruejo and Commissioner Chavez voted against. Commissioner Connelly was absent. The motion carried 4:2:1:0:0¹.

¹ In Favor: Against: Absent: Abstain: Recused

MAIN MOTION VOTE:

Vice Chair Stewart, Commissioners Dr. Lopez, Nash and Zielsdorf voted in favor. Chair Arruejo and Commissioner Chavez voted against. Commissioner Connelly was absent. The motion carried 4:2:1:0:0²

Chair Arruejo opened the public comments portion of the public hearing.

Verbal comments were received by public speakers in favor of the appeal project: Sol Majer, Jeff Weiss, Rabbi Dov Muchnik, Solomon Goldner, Brian Dror, Daniel Voss, Ari Goldner, Perri Leftkowitz, AJ Mandelbaum, Fred Cervantez and Gary Rosen, Bob Yurik, Sienna Marie Cesna and Jesus Torres.

Verbal comments were received by public speakers against the project: David Lavfer, Walter Hagedohm, Diane Delaney

MOTION:

Commissioner Nash moved and Vice Chair Dr. Stewart seconded the motion to have Mr. Walter Hagedohm and before Diane Delaney and increase the speaking time of Diane Delaney from default of three minutes to five minutes.

MOTION VOTE:

Vice Chair Stewart, Commissioners Dr. Lopez, Nash and Zielsdorf voted in favor. Chair Arruejo and Commissioner Chavez voted against. Commissioner Connelly was absent. The motion carried 4:2:1:0:0³

Chair Arruejo closed the public comments portion of the public hearing.

Verbal comments and questions were received by the Chair and Commissioners regarding safety, deed restrictions, religious freedom, alternative locations for the hot tub, location of other hot tubs in the area, noise, permit violations, privacy, and dispute between neighbors.

Discussion ensued among the Commissioners and staff about several topics, including: fairness of the Commissioners, public speakers participation, hot tub, appeal process, existing restriction on hot tub placement, history of violations on the property.

MOTION:

Commissioner Chavez moved and Commissioner Nash seconded the motion to find the Project to be Statutorily Exempt from the requirements of the

² In Favor: Against: Absent: Abstain: Recused

³ In Favor: Against: Absent: Abstain: Recused

California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) pursuant to CEQA Guidelines Section 15270 (“Projects Which are Disapproved”); and adopt Resolution 2023-33 denying the Appeal and upholding the Community Development Director’s Denial of Planning and Zoning Permit No. 23-400-01 (Coastal Development Permit).

MOTION VOTE:

Chair Arruejo, Vice Chair Stewart, Commissioners Chavez, Nash and Zielsdorf voted in favor. Commissioner Dr. Lopez voted against. Commissioner Connelly was absent. The motion carried 5:1:1:0:0⁴

F. STUDY SESSION/REPORTS

1. **None**

G. PLANNING COMMISSION BUSINESS

1. Commissioner Dr. Lopez commented on exceptions of processes and following policies.
2. Commissioner Chavez agreed with Dr. Lopez on remaining on a path and sticking to the processes in place for Planning Commission Meetings. He also announced that tonight would be his last night as a commissioner due to him running for City Council.
3. Vice Chair Dr. Stewart spoke about supporting the Brow Act but also being consistent with meeting processes and policies.
4. Commissioner Nash thanked staff and the City Attorney for their support. He thanked Commissioner Chavez for his service as a Commissioner.
5. Chair Arruejo thanked Commissioner Chavez for his service as a Commissioner.

H. COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT STAFF UPDATES

1. Joe Pearson II thanked Commissioner Chavez for his service as a Commissioner and spoke about the Planning Commission bylaws and about items for the November 2nd meeting.

I. ADJOURNMENT

1. At 8:30 pm., the Planning Commission concurred to adjourn.

⁴ In Favor: Against: Absent: Abstain: Recused

FUTURE MEETINGS

Regular Meeting: Thursday, November 2, 2023, 6:00 p.m, Oxnard Chambers

Ronald Arruejo,
Chair

ATTEST _____
Joe Pearson II,
Planning & Environmental Services Manager

DRAFT MINUTES
OXNARD PLANNING COMMISSION
Thursday, November 2, 2023

A. ROLL CALL

1. At 6:00 pm the Oxnard Planning Commission convened in the Oxnard Chambers.
2. Chair Arruejo, Commissioners Connelly, Dr. Lopez and Zielsdorf were present. Vice Chair Dr. Stewart was absent.
3. Staff members present were: Joe Pearson II, Planning & Environmental Services Manager; Ken Rozell, Chief Assistant City Attorney; Emilio Ramirez, Housing Director; and Miriam Loera, Administration Services Specialist.
4. Chair Arruejo presided and called the meeting to order.

B. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE TO THE FLAG OF THE UNITED STATES

1. Commissioner Connelly

C. PUBLIC COMMENTS - On Items Not On The Agenda

1. None

D. CONSENT AGENDA

1. None

E. EX PARTE DECLARATIONS FOR PUBLIC HEARING ITEMS

1. None

F. PUBLIC HEARING

1. **Project Name: 131 East Seventh Street Property Acquisition;** PLANNING AND ZONING PERMIT NO. 23-625-04 (General Plan Conformity Determination); Located at 131 East Seventh Street; APN 201-0-272-040. A request that the Planning Commission adopt a resolution affirming that the City of Oxnard's acquisition of real property located at 131 East Seventh Street is in conformance with the City of Oxnard 2030 General Plan and recommending that the City Council acquire the property. The request is exempt from environmental review pursuant to the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Guidelines Section 15061(b)(3) and Section 15378(b)(5). Requested by Emilio Ramirez, Housing Director, on behalf of the City of Oxnard, 435 South D Street, Oxnard, CA 93030.
City Staff: Joe Pearson II, Planning Environmental Services Manager

Recommendation: That the Planning Commission:

In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need special assistance to participate in a meeting, you should contact the office of the City Clerk at (805) 385-7803. Notification 72 hours prior to the meeting will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements to assure accessibility to the meeting.

Written materials relating to an item on this agenda that are distributed to the Planning Commission within 72 hours before the item is to be considered at its regularly scheduled meeting will be made available for public inspection at 214 South C Street, during customary business hours.

- a. Find the acquisition of unimproved real property located at 131 East Seventh Street exempt from environmental review pursuant to the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Guidelines Section 15061(b)(3) and Section 15378(b)(5); and
- b. Adopt Resolution 2023-34 affirming that the City of Oxnard's acquisition of real property located at APN 201-0-272-040 is in conformance with the City of Oxnard 2030 General Plan, and recommending that the City Council order the acquisition.

Joe Pearson II, Planning Environmental Services Manager provided the required Measure M pre-recorded presentation video outlining the request which was posted with the agenda: <https://youtu.be/lfkVTwdUMLk>

City Staff including: Joe Pearson, Planning & Environmental Services Manager; Ken Rozell, Chief Assistant City Attorney; Emilio Ramirez, Housing Director were available for questions.

No verbal comments or questions were received by Commissioners

Chair Arruejo opened the public comments portion of the public hearing.

No verbal comments received by public speakers

Vice Chair Stewart closed the public comments portion of the public hearing.

MOTION:

Commissioner Nash moved and Commissioner Dr. Lopez seconded the motion to find the acquisition of unimproved real property located at 131 East Seventh Street exempt from environmental review pursuant to the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Guidelines Section 15061(b)(3) and Section 15378(b)(5); and adopt Resolution 2023-34 affirming that the City of Oxnard's acquisition of real property located at APN 201-0-272-040 is in conformance with the City of Oxnard 2030 General Plan, and recommending that the City Council order the acquisition.

MOTION VOTE:

Chair Arruejo, Commissioners Connelly, Dr. Lopez, Nash and Zielsdorf voted in favor. Vice Chair Dr. Stewart was absent. The motion carried 5:0:1:0:0¹.

¹ In Favor: Against: Absent: Abstain: Recused

2. **Project Name: 418 West Fourth Street Property Disposition;** Planning and Zoning Permit No. 23-625-05 (General Plan Conformity Determination) - Located at 418 West Fourth Street; APN 202-0-085-190. A request that the Planning Commission adopt a resolution affirming that the City of Oxnard's disposition of real property located at 418 West Fourth Street is in conformance with the City of Oxnard 2030 General Plan and recommending that the City Council dispose of the property. The request is exempt from environmental review pursuant to the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Guidelines Section 15061(b)(3) and Section 15378(b)(5). Requested by Emilio Ramirez, Housing Director, on behalf of the City of Oxnard, 435 South D Street, Oxnard, CA 93030. **City Staff: Joe Pearson II, Planning Environmental Services Manager**

Recommendation: That the Planning Commission:

- a. Find the disposition of improved real property located at 418 West Fourth Street exempt from environmental review pursuant to the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Guidelines Section 15061(b)(3) and Section 15378(b)(5); and
- b. Adopt Resolution 2023-35 affirming that the City of Oxnard's disposition of real property located at APN 202-0-085-190 is in conformance with the City of Oxnard 2030 General Plan, and recommending that the City Council order the disposition.

Joe Pearson II, Planning Environmental Services Manager provided the required Measure M pre-recorded presentation video outlining the request which was posted with the agenda: https://youtu.be/6_BdyJjs3aQ

City Staff including: Joe Pearson, Planning & Environmental Services Manager; Ken Rozell, Chief Assistant City Attorney; and Emilio Ramirez, Housing Director were available for questions.

Verbal comments and questions were received by Commissioner Dr. Lopez on disposition of properties.

Chair Arruejo opened the public comments portion of the public hearing.

No verbal comment received by a public speaker.

Chair Arruejo closed the public comments portion of the public hearing.

Commissioner Nash commented on the Children's Museum.

MOTION:

Commissioner Dr. Lopez moved and Commissioner Connelly seconded the motion to find the disposition of improved real property located at 418 West

Fourth Street exempt from environmental review pursuant to the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Guidelines Section 15061(b)(3) and Section 15378(b)(5); and adopt Resolution 2023-35 affirming that the City of Oxnard's disposition of real property located at APN 202-0-085-190 is in conformance with the City of Oxnard 2030 General Plan, and recommending that the City Council order the disposition.

MOTION VOTE:

Chair Arruejo, Commissioners Connelly, Dr. Lopez, Nash and Zielsdorf voted in favor. Vice Chair Dr. Stewart was absent. The motion carried 5:1:1:0:0².

3. **Project Name: 5587 Saviers Road Daya Enterprises Project; PLANNING AND ZONING PERMIT NO. 22-500-02 (Special Use Permit);** Located at 5587 Saviers Road, Oxnard, CA 93003 (APN: 222-0-011-110). The applicant requests to construct a two-story, 4,455 square-foot, 24-hour convenience store (no alcohol) with 2,755 square feet of ground floor retail and payment area and 1,700 square foot office area on the second floor. The project also includes a fuel canopy with eight fuel stations, parking, trash enclosure and related site improvements. The hours of operation for the project are proposed to be 24 hours per day, Monday through Sunday. The project is Categorically Exempt in accordance with Section 15303 pursuant to provisions of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Guidelines. Filed by John Muller, Muller Worthy Architects, 1451-D Rice Avenue, Oxnard CA 93030, designated agent on behalf of Daya Enterprises, 6901 Worth Way, Camarillo, CA 93012.

City Staff: Brenna Wengert, AICP, Contract Planner

Recommendation: That the Planning Commission:

- a. Find the Project to be Categorically Exempt from environmental review pursuant to the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Guidelines Section 15303 (New Construction or Conversion of Small Structures); and
- b. Adopt Resolution 2023-36 approving Planning and Zoning Permit No 22-500-02 (Special Use Permit), subject to certain findings and conditions.

Joe Pearson II, Planning Environmental Services Manager provided the required Measure M pre-recorded presentation video outlining the request which was posted with the agenda: <https://youtu.be/HGwVhLlpcg4>

City Staff and Consultants Including: Joe Pearson, Planning & Environmental Services Manager; Ken Rozell, Chief Assistant City Attorney; Bradley Misner, Contract Planner; and Brenna Wengert, Contract Planner were available for questions.

² In Favor: Against: Absent: Abstain: Recused

The applicant John Muller, Architect gave a presentation and was available for questions.

Verbal comments and questions were received by Chair Arruejo on alcohol use permits and the use of the second floor for the location.

Vice Chair Stewart opened the public comments portion of the public hearing.

No verbal comments received by public speakers.

Chair Arruejo closed the public comments portion of the public hearing.

Discussion ensued among the Commissioners and staff about several topics, including: Benefits to the community the project will bring, solar energy to help during a natural disaster or power outage, public meetings regarding lighting and graffiti and the notices mailed.

MOTION:

Commissioner Connelly moved and Commissioner Nash seconded the motion to find the Project to be Categorically Exempt from environmental review pursuant to the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Guidelines Section 15303 (New Construction or Conversion of Small Structures); and adopt Resolution 2023-36 approving Planning and Zoning Permit No 22-500-02 (Special Use Permit), subject to certain findings and conditions and the two added conditions:

1. A solar photovoltaic (PV) system shall be installed to the extent feasible, which complies with the California Energy Code and subject to compliance with Southern California Edison Requirements. California Edison, as the local electric service provider, shall be consulted to ensure that PV system sizing will comply with the Energy Design Rating (EDR) targets. (PL)
2. If required by applicable regulations at the time of building permit issuance, the applicant shall provide EV charging infrastructure and/or charging stations. (PL)

MOTION VOTE:

Chair Arruejo, Commissioners Connelly, Dr. Lopez, Nash and Zielsdorf voted in favor. Vice Chair Dr. Stewart was absent. The motion carried 5:0:1:0:0³.

³ In Favor: Against: Absent: Abstain: Recused

F. STUDY SESSION/REPORTS

1. None

G. PLANNING COMMISSION BUSINESS

1. Chair Arruejo commented on the Bylaws for Planning Commission future City Council Date.
2. Commissioner Connelly commented on November being Native American month and honoring Veterans day.

H. COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT STAFF UPDATES

1. Joe Pearson II commented on the upcoming meeting on November 16, 2023.
2. Ken Rozell commented on a letter received regarding a prior item that came before the Planning Commission.

I. ADJOURNMENT

1. At 6:32 pm., the Planning Commission concurred to adjourn.

FUTURE MEETINGS

Regular Meeting: Thursday, November 16, 2023, 6:00 p.m, Oxnard Chambers

Ronald Arruejo,
Chair

ATTEST _____
Joe Pearson II,
Planning & Environmental Services Manager

MINUTES
OXNARD PLANNING COMMISSION
Thursday, November 16, 2023

A. ROLL CALL

1. At 6:00 pm the Oxnard Planning Commission convened in the Oxnard Chambers.
2. Chair Arruejo, Vice Chair Dr. Stewart, Commissioners Connelly, Dr. Lopez and Zielsdorf were present.
3. Staff members present were: Joe Pearson II, Planning & Environmental Services Manager; Ken Rozell, Chief Assistant City Attorney; Daniel Houck, Associate Planner; Jay Dobrowalski, Planning Supervisor; and Miriam Loera, Administration Services Specialist.
4. Chair Arruejo presided and called the meeting to order.

B. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE TO THE FLAG OF THE UNITED STATES

1. Commissioner Connelly

C. PUBLIC COMMENTS - On Items Not On The Agenda

1. None

D. CONSENT AGENDA

1. APPROVAL OF MINUTES- August 3, 2023
2. APPROVAL OF MINUTES- September 7, 2023

MOTION:

Commissioner Connelly moved and Vice Chair Dr. Stewart seconded the motion of approval of minutes for the October 20, 2022, Planning Commission meeting with the following amendments to the Roll Call and edits to the modified parking requirement for Single Room Occupancy uses in the Motion for Item F.1, respectively:

1. Vice Chair Stewart, Commissioners Connelly, Dr. Lopez, Nash and Zielsdorf were present. Commissioner Chavez and Chair Arruejo were absent.
2. ~~One off-street space per two units and~~ One easily accessible long-term bicycle storage space per unit.

VOTE:

Chair Arruejo, Vice Chair Dr. Stewart, Commissioner Connelly, Nash and

In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need special assistance to participate in a meeting, you should contact the office of the City Clerk at (805) 385-7803. Notification 72 hours prior to the meeting will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements to assure accessibility to the meeting.

Written materials relating to an item on this agenda that are distributed to the Planning Commission within 72 hours before the item is to be considered at its regularly scheduled meeting will be made available for public inspection at 214 South C Street, during customary business hours.

Zielsdorf voted in favor. Commissioner Dr. Lopez abstained. The motion carried 5:0:0:1:0¹.

E. EX PARTE DECLARATIONS FOR PUBLIC HEARING ITEMS

1. None

F. PUBLIC HEARING

1. **Project Name: Verizon Wireless Monopine Tower;** Planning and Zoning Permit No. 23-530-02 (Special Use Permit - Wireless); Located at 2400 Eastman Ave (APN: 216-0-193-135). A request to construct a 65-foot tall wireless communication facility designed to resemble a pine tree with an associated ground equipment enclosure on a 2.75 acre lot in the M-1 zone. The request includes the allowance for an increase in height from 40 feet to 65 feet. The project is located within an open area of the lot used for storage by an existing industrial business. The project is Categorically Exempt in accordance with Section 15303 pursuant to provisions of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Guidelines. Filed by designated agent Franklin Orozco, Black Rock, Irvine, CA 92618, on behalf of Verizon Wireless.

City Staff: Daniel Houck, Associate Planner

Recommendation: That the Planning Commission:

- a. Find the project Exempt from environmental review pursuant to the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Guidelines Section 15303 Class 3 (New Construction); and
- b. Adopt Resolution 2023-37 approving Planning and Zoning Permit No. 23-530-02 (Special Use Permit Wireless), subject to certain findings and conditions.

Daniel Houck, Associate Planner provided the required Measure M pre-recorded presentation video outlining the request which was posted with the agenda: <https://youtu.be/4kgO1EhALTM>

City Staff including: Joe Pearson, Planning & Environmental Services Manager; Ken Rozell, Chief Assistant City Attorney; and Daniel Houck, Associate Planner were available for questions.

The applicant Franklin Orozco provided a presentation and was available for questions.

Verbal comments or questions were received by Chair Arruejo, Vice Chair Dr. Stewart and

¹ In Favor: Against: Absent: Abstain: Recused

Commissioner Dr. Lopez on the amount of carriers per tower, outdated structures and the future use for those structures, height and coverage area, need in the communities for service

Chair Arruejo opened the public comments portion of the public hearing.

No verbal comments received by public speakers

Chair Arruejo closed the public comments portion of the public hearing.

MOTION:

Commissioner Nash moved and Vice Chair Dr. Stewart seconded the motion to find the project Exempt from environmental review pursuant to the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Guidelines Section 15303 Class 3 (New Construction); and adopt Resolution 2023-37 approving Planning and Zoning Permit No. 23-530-02 (Special Use Permit Wireless), subject to certain findings and conditions.

MOTION VOTE:

Chair Arruejo, Vice Chair Dr. Stewart, Commissioners Connelly, Dr. Lopez, Nash and Zielsdorf voted in favor. The motion carried 6:0:0:0².

2. **Project Name: Santiago Industrial Suites Tentative Map;** Planning and Zoning Permit Nos. 23-500-08 (Special Use Permit) and 22-300-03 (Tentative Tract Map No. 6062) for a Tentative Subdivision Map for condominium purposes; Located at 1400 Graves Avenue and 2301 Santiago Court (APN: 214-0-031-025). The applicant requests a Tentative Subdivision Map (Permit No. 22-300-03) and Special Use Permit (Permit No. 23-500-08) to subdivide a 4.16-acre lot for condominium purposes. The project site is the location of a recently approved and under construction development of two industrial buildings containing 12 tenant spaces each. The Tentative Subdivision Map would subdivide the property to create one lot for common area (containing parking, driveways, landscaping and pedestrian pathways) and 24 lots matching the buildings for industrial condominiums. The project is Categorically Exempt in accordance with Section 15301 pursuant to provisions of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Guidelines.

City Staff: Lisa Gordon, Senior Contract Planner and Jay Dobrowalski, Planning Supervisor.

Recommendation: That the Planning Commission:

² In Favor: Against: Absent: Abstain: Recused

- a. Find the Project to be Categorically Exempt from environmental review pursuant to the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Guidelines Section 15301(k) (Existing Facilities);
- b. Adopt Resolution 2023-38 recommending that the City Council approve Planning and Zoning Permit No. 22-300-03 for a Tentative Subdivision Map (Tentative Tract Map No. 6062), subject to certain findings and conditions; and,
- c. Adopt Resolution 2023-39 approving Planning and Zoning Permit No. 23-500-08 for a Special Use Permit, subject to certain findings and conditions.

Jay Dobrowalski, Planning Supervisor provided the required Measure M pre-recorded presentation video outlining the request which was posted with the agenda: <https://youtu.be/xsdphNQsmEU>

City Staff and Consultants Including: Joe Pearson, Planning & Environmental Services Manager; Ken Rozell, Chief Assistant City Attorney; and Jay Dobrowalski, Planning Supervisor. were available for questions.

The applicant, Eric Zentner, was available for questions.

Verbal comments and questions were received by Chair Arruejo, Commissioner Nash, Dr. Lopez Connelly, on purpose of units, applicants involvement, ownership of property by buyers and need of small industrial spaces.

Chair Arruejo opened the public comments portion of the public hearing.

No verbal comment received by a public speaker.

Chair Arruejo closed the public comments portion of the public hearing.

MOTION:

Commissioner Dr. Lopez moved and Commissioner Connelly seconded the motion to find the Project to be Categorically Exempt from environmental review pursuant to the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Guidelines Section 15301(k) (Existing Facilities); adopt Resolution 2023-38 recommending that the City Council approve Planning and Zoning Permit No. 22-300-03 for a Tentative Subdivision Map (Tentative Tract Map No. 6062), subject to certain findings and conditions; and adopt Resolution 2023-39 approving Planning and Zoning Permit No. 23-500-08 for a Special Use Permit, subject to certain findings and conditions.

MOTION VOTE:

Chair Arruejo, Vice Chair Dr. Stewart, Commissioners Connelly, Dr. Lopez, Nash and Zielsdorf voted in favor. The motion carried 6:0:0:0:³.

F. STUDY SESSION/REPORTS

1. None

G. PLANNING COMMISSION BUSINESS

1. Vice Chair Dr. Stewart had a question about the role of the Environmental Resources division, which was answered by Joe Pearson II, Planning and Environmental Services Manager.
2. Chair Arruejo commented on the Planning Commission Bylaws going to the City Council this upcoming Tuesday (November 21, 2023). Chair Arruejo also discussed the potential for future changes to the Bylaws to be discussed at a future date.

H. COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT STAFF UPDATES

1. Joe Pearson II commented on the Planning Commission Bylaws going to City Council on November 21, 2023 and also commented on the upcoming meeting on December 7, 2023.

I. ADJOURNMENT

1. At 6:34 pm., the Planning Commission concurred to adjourn.

FUTURE MEETINGS

Regular Meeting: Thursday, December 7, 2023, 6:00 p.m, Oxnard Chambers

Ronald Arruejo,
Chair

ATTEST _____
Joe Pearson II,
Planning & Environmental Services Manager

³ In Favor: Against: Absent: Abstain: Recused

2024 Planning Calendar

January						
S	M	T	W	T	F	S
	1	2	3	4	5	6
7	8	9	10	11	12	13
14	15	16	17	18	19	20
21	22	23	24	25	26	27
28	29	30	31			

February						
S	M	T	W	T	F	S
				1	2	3
4	5	6	7	8	9	10
11	12	13	14	15	16	17
18	19	20	21	22	23	24
25	26	27	28	29		

March						
S	M	T	W	T	F	S
					1	2
3	4	5	6	7	8	9
10	11	12	13	14	15	16
17	18	19	20	21	22	23
24	25	26	27	28	29	30
31						

April						
S	M	T	W	T	F	S
1	2	3	4	5	6	
7	8	9	10	11	12	13
14	15	16	17	18	19	20
21	22	23	24	25	26	27
28	29	30				

May						
S	M	T	W	T	F	S
			1	2	3	4
5	6	7	8	9	10	11
12	13	14	15	16	17	18
19	20	21	22	23	24	25
26	27	28	29	30	31	

June						
S	M	T	W	T	F	S
						1
2	3	4	5	6	7	8
9	10	11	12	13	14	15
16	17	18	19	20	21	22
23	24	25	26	27	28	29
30						

July						
S	M	T	W	T	F	S
	1	2	3	4	5	6
7	8	9	10	11	12	13
14	15	16	17	18	19	20
21	22	23	24	25	26	27
28	29	30	31			

August						
S	M	T	W	T	F	S
				1	2	3
4	5	6	7	8	9	10
11	12	13	14	15	16	17
18	19	20	21	22	23	24
25	26	27	28	29	30	31

September						
S	M	T	W	T	F	S
1	2	3	4	5	6	7
8	9	10	11	12	13	14
15	16	17	18	19	20	21
22	23	24	25	26	27	28
29	30					

October						
S	M	T	W	T	F	S
		1	2	3	4	5
6	7	8	9	10	11	12
13	14	15	16	17	18	19
20	21	22	23	24	25	26
27	28	29	30	31		

November						
S	M	T	W	T	F	S
					1	2
3	4	5	6	7	8	9
10	11	12	13	14	15	16
17	18	19	20	21	22	23
24	25	26	27	28	29	30

December						
S	M	T	W	T	F	S
1	2	3	4	5	6	7
8	9	10	11	12	13	14
15	16	17	18	19	20	21
22	23	24	25	26	27	28
29	30	31				

 City Council

 Committee

 Planning Commission

 Community Workshop

 DAC

 APA Conference

 League of CA Academy

 Closed Friday

 Half-Day Holiday

 Holiday